Page 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, Plaintiff, Case No.: 18-15099 (AET) (ZNQ) v. SHANT HOVNANIAN, et al., Defendants. Remote Deposition of MICHAEL MACGILLIVRAY Friday, February 5, 2021 12:03 p.m. (EST) Reported by: Stephanie M. Butler Job No.: 1289

```
Page 2
 1
 2
                            February 5, 2021
 3
                            12:03 p.m. (EST)
                            Manahawkin, New Jersey
 4
 5
 6
                Remote Deposition of Michael
 7
     MacGillivray, held via Zoom
 8
     videoconferencing, pursuant to Subpoena,
     before Stephanie M. Butler, a Notary Public
 9
10
     of the State of New York.
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

```
Page 3
 1
 2
    REMOTE APPEARANCES:
 3
 4
    U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
 5
    Attorneys for Plaintiff
 6
               950 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest
 7
               Washington, D.C. 20530
               ARI KUNOFSKY, ESQ.
 8
    BY:
 9
               Ari.D.Kunofsky@usdoj.gov
10
               CATRIONA COPPLER, ESQ.
               Catriona.M.Coppler@usdoj.gov
11
12
     HANAMIRIAN LAW FIRM, P.C.
13
    Attorneys for Defendants
14
               40 East Main Street
15
               Moorsetown, New Jersey 08057
16
    BY:
              JOHN HANAMIRIAN, ESQ.
17
               jmh@hanamirian.com
18
19
20
    ALSO PRESENT:
21
        ELZA GRIGORYAN,
23
        HANAMIRIAN LAW FIRM, P.C.
24
25
```

```
Page 4
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               THE COURT REPORTER:
                                    My name is
 3
         Stephanie Butler, a New York State
         notary public.
 4
               This deposition is being held
 5
 6
         via videoconferencing equipment.
 7
         witness and reporter are not in the
         same room.
               The witness will be sworn in
 9
10
         remotely, pursuant to agreement of all
11
         parties.
                   The parties stipulate that
12
         the testimony is being given as if the
13
         witness was sworn in person.
14
     MICHAEL
                      MACGILLIVRAY,
15
            called as a witness, having been duly
16
            sworn by a Notary Public, was
17
            examined and testified as follows:
18
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Last night, I
19
         guess you guys sent over a -- this
20
         memorandum from Chief Counsel relative
21
         to guidelines or parameters of the
22
         deposition itself. I don't know if
23
         you want to you offer -- you said you
24
         wanted to offer that as an exhibit?
25
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
                              Yes.
```

```
Page 5
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: So I don't have
 3
         any objection to that.
               MR. KUNOFSKY: We'll send to the
 5
         court reporter at the end of this
 6
         deposition Mr. MacGillivray's
 7
         testimonial authorization issued by
         the Office of Chief Counsel from the
 8
 9
         IRS and the -- Mr. MacGillivray wants
10
         to read and sign.
11
                (Whereupon, Office of Chief
12
         Counsel Internal Revenue Service
13
         Memorandum, was marked as Plaintiff's
14
         Exhibit 1 for identification, as of
15
         this date.)
16
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 I think you
17
         need that for the record. Good. All
18
         right. So where are we?
19
     EXAMINATION BY
20
     MR. HANAMIRIAN:
21
               State your name for the record.
         Q
22
         Α
               Michael MacGillivray.
23
               State your address for the
         Q
24
     record.
25
         Α
               4 Paragon Way, Suite 2,
```

```
Page 6
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
     Freehold, New Jersey 07728.
 3
         Q
               Mr. MacGillivray, how are you?
         Δ
               I'm well.
 5
               Do you have any questions about
         Q
 6
     the deposition process? I'm sure Ari or
     Cat or both have prepared you for today.
 8
         Α
               No questions, sir.
 9
               Have you given a deposition
         Q
     before?
10
11
         Α
               On one occasion. It was a
12
     relatively short matter. My son was
     involved in a car accident. I owned the
13
     vehicle.
14
               There was an injury and he was
     sued, and it was a 10-minute deposition
15
     that I sat for.
16
17
               So you've been in the
         0
     environment before?
18
19
         Α
               Yes, sir.
20
               Okay. So you don't need my
         Q
21
     help.
22
               So, in any event, we're here,
23
     obviously, today for this matter relative
24
     to the two trusts and to -- well, formerly
25
     two -- Shant Hovnanian.
```

```
Page 7
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                What's been your role in the
 3
     underlying tax matter in this case?
         Α
                I was the revenue officer.
 5
                And so were you the first, the
         Q
     last, the middle, or the only revenue
 6
     officer who participated in the case?
                I was one of three revenue
 8
         Α
 9
     officers, as I recall, that worked the
10
     case.
                Do you remember who the other
11
         0
12
     two are?
13
         Α
                Yes.
14
         Q
                Okay.
15
                Can you tell us?
                There was a gentleman named Gary
16
17
     Rutledge that was involved and a woman
     named Rebecca Troichuk.
18
19
         Q
                Okay.
20
                Are they both out of the Paragon
21
     Way office?
22
                Mr. Rutledge was from the Cherry
     Hill office.
23
24
         Q
                Okay.
25
                Rebecca Troichuk was from the
         Α
```

```
Page 8
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     Freehold office.
 3
         Q
               Okay.
               And is there any rationale to
 5
     the sequencing?
                      Did you just take over
 6
     the file, or was there reason that it went
     from one to the next to you?
 8
                I was the primary revenue
     officer.
 9
10
         Q
               Okay.
11
                Are you good? I'm sorry, did it
12
     freeze or --
13
                I got a -- something came --
         Α
     something came up saying that it was --
14
15
     can you hear me now?
16
         Q
                Yes.
17
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
                               Yes.
18
                Okay, because something came up
         Α
19
     saying that my connection was unstable.
20
                It said it's unbelievable, yes,
         0
21
     yes.
22
         Α
                So I was the primary revenue
23
               My supervisor at the time
     officer.
24
     assigned the other revenue officers to
25
     work the case with me.
```

```
Page 9
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Oh, okay.
 3
               Okay, so you were always
     involved?
 4
 5
         Α
               I believe so, yes.
 6
         Q
               Okay.
               And then what was the
 8
     precipitating event? Was there an audit?
 9
     Was there -- what started the process
     within the service?
10
11
               There -- I know that the
12
     assessments that I was assigned to collect
13
     resulted from a -- tax court cases.
14
         Q
               Okay.
15
               And so there wasn't -- so, I
     mean, to your knowledge, there wasn't an
16
17
     independent audit, but rather it was just
     collecting the assessment coming out of
18
19
     the case out of the litigation?
20
               Yeah, I have no -- I was not
         Α
21
     involved in the assessment piece.
22
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
23
               And so the underlying -- we
24
     don't know -- or do you know if there was
25
     any -- if there was any administrative
```

```
Page 10
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     process before it went to tax court?
 3
     they go through appeals? Did it come out
     of audit and went through appeals and then
 5
     to tax court, or you don't know?
                All of that seems likely.
 6
         Α
         Q
               Yes.
 8
         Α
                I don't recall. I mean, I
 9
     wasn't involved in that, so I have no
10
     personal knowledge of exactly what
11
     transpired.
12
         Q
               Okay.
13
                So your role in this instance
14
     was supervisory on the collection side
15
     only, and then supervising two other
     personnel or two other revenue officers in
16
17
     the process?
18
         Α
               My role was not supervisory.
19
                I'm sorry. Go ahead.
         Q
20
               My role was that of a revenue
         Α
21
     officer.
22
         0
               Okay.
               Well --
23
         Α
24
                Yes, and I don't -- I just want
         Q
25
     to understand.
                      I don't -- because it
```

```
Page 11
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     doesn't make sense just because I don't
 3
     understand.
                So did you have a team?
                                          Were
 5
     the three of you a team?
 6
                My supervisor had assigned these
     other revenue officers to assist with the
 8
     case.
 9
         Q
                Oh, okay. Okay.
10
                And to assist you?
11
                Yeah.
         Α
12
                I don't know if it matters.
         Q
13
                Yeah.
         Α
                I just want to understand.
14
         Q
15
                       I would say so, yeah.
         Α
                Yeah.
16
         Q
                Okay. Okay.
17
                And so, then, how did the
     process begin?
18
19
         Α
                The collection process?
20
         Q
                Yes.
21
                So it comes out of tax court.
22
     There's a judgment. The appeal period
23
     expires.
                They send it over to collection.
24
                And then what happened here?
25
                My first activity was to -- at
         Α
```

Page 12 1 MACGILLIVRAY first, I received two of the four periods. 3 The other two were not immediately assigned to me. One had been placed into 4 5 a currently-not-collectible status 6 erroneously. Q One of the years? Α One of the years. 9 Q How many years were in issue; do 10 you remember? 11 I recall four years. Α 12 Q Okay. Okay. 13 So I was initially assigned two. Α 14 One of the years had this erroneous 15 currently-not-collectible status based on an erroneous collection statute. 16 17 processed paperwork to have that assigned 18 to me. 19 The fourth period remained with 20 a litigation hold based on the tax court 21 case, and I received assignment of that 22 sometime later. 23 Q Okay. 24 So when you say -- you know I'm 25 going to ask.

Page 13 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 So an erroneous collection 3 statute issue, I guess, did somebody present an argument to somebody within the 4 5 service that the time for collection with respect to a particular year had expired 6 based on the statute? 8 Α I have no direct knowledge of 9 who put it into a non-collectible status, 10 but it was probably based on a transcript, 11 the reading of a transcript. 12 Oh, so it may have been done 0 independently within the service without 13 some outside participation? 14 15 That's my belief, yes. Α Oh, okay. Okay. 16 Q 17 And then the fourth period, were you the -- the fourth one, you were saying 18 19 was held on litigation hold? 20 Α Yes, sir. 21 The time for the tax court Q 22 matter hadn't expired at that point. 23 Okay. Okay. 24 And so then what was your -- all 25 right, so you get involved.

```
Page 14
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               You have these, now, four
 3
     periods, right? Once you have all the
     periods in issue, then what? What's your
 4
 5
     process, or what was your process?
               I contact -- well, we sent out
 6
     letters of -- Letter 1058, Final Demand
 8
     Letter.
 9
         Q
               Okay.
10
               And I contacted Mr. Hovnanian's
     power of attorney, a gentleman named Read
11
12
     Rankin, as I recall.
13
         Q
               Yes, attorney, yes.
14
               And what's the dialogue there if
15
     you recall?
               We discussed the liabilities.
16
17
     requested -- well, initially, he was
     unsure if he would represent Mr. Hovnanian
18
     or not in the collection matter.
19
20
         0
               Okay.
21
         Α
               And he wanted to contact
22
     Mr. Hovnanian to see if he would still
23
     represent him.
24
         Q
               Okay.
25
               So I guess he did that, yes?
```

```
Page 15
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                Yeah, subsequently, he
 3
     determined that he would represent
     Mr. Hovnanian. Financial information was
 4
 5
     requested.
                433 stuff, the financials?
 6
         Q
         Α
               Yes, sir.
 8
         Q
               Okay.
 9
               And was that received? Did you
10
     get that?
11
               No, sir.
         Α
12
         Q
                Was there any reason given or --
13
         Α
               No, sir, not that I recall.
                                   Did the
14
         Q
                So what happened?
15
     process then stop as far as the
     communication with Mr. Rankin?
16
17
         Α
                There were a few -- there may
     have been another call, but at that point
18
19
     I started to -- an investigation to
20
     determine other -- you know, to determine
21
     income and assets.
22
         Q
               On your own?
               As a revenue officer.
23
         Α
24
                Did you send out summonses?
         Q
25
         Α
                In the case, yes.
```

```
Page 16
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 3
               We have -- in the discovery
     process here from Ari's office, they sent
 4
 5
     over documentation that appears to be
 6
     responsive to some sort of request on your
     part, either summons or whatever.
 8
     typically summons is why I say it.
 9
               Can I go through some of that
10
     with you?
11
         Α
               Of course.
12
         0
               Up on this -- on the shared
13
     screen, which I just learned about 40
14
     minutes ago. Have some patience.
15
               Look at number 17, so it would
16
     be MM17.
17
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 For those
18
         playing along at home, it's MM17.
19
                (Whereupon, PNC Bank Records
20
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000458 through
21
         USAPROD-000510, were marked as
22
         Defendants' Exhibit 1 for
23
         identification, as of this date.)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
24
25
               Is the document turning page for
         Q
```

```
Page 17
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     you now?
 3
         Α
               It did turn page.
               It. did?
         Q
 5
         Α
               It did.
 6
         Q
               Okay. Good.
                             So then I've got
 7
                 Thank you. And, again, I
     it.
         Okay.
 8
     apologize. Just indulge me because it's
 9
     my first time doing it that way. Okay.
10
               So this document -- I wanted to
     go back to this page dated August 22,
11
12
     2017, addressed to R. Troichuk, whom you
13
     identified as another revenue officer who
14
     was involved in the case, correct?
15
               Yes, sir.
         Α
               And this is relative -- it
16
         Q
     says -- the re: says, "Zargis Medical
17
18
     Group."
19
               And this is, what, if you
20
     recall?
              What is this set of documents?
21
         Α
               That is a cover letter from PNC
22
     Bank indicating that there are bank
     records attached.
23
24
         Q
               For Zargis Medical Corp.?
25
         Α
               Yes, sir, for Zargis Medical
```

```
Page 18
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     Corp.
 3
         Q
                So how did you get to Zargis
     Medical Corp. from Shant Hovnanian, if you
 4
 5
     recall?
               Well, the -- some of the
 6
         Α
 7
     tenants -- Zargis Medical Corp.
 8
         Q
                Take your time. Even I tell my
 9
     own people, it's never a test. Just, you
10
     know, if you --
11
                I believe Zargis Medical Corp.
12
     stemmed from the payment of municipal
13
     taxes on real property.
14
         Q
               Municipal property tax?
15
               Yeah.
         Α
16
         Q
               Okay.
17
         Α
               Yeah.
18
         Q
               Okay.
19
                So Zargis had paid -- or you
20
     think that Zargis had paid property tax on
21
     behalf of -- or on the real estate that
22
     was part of this -- that's the subject of
23
     this nominee lien?
24
         Α
                Payment was made through the
25
     Zargis account, as I recall.
```

```
Page 19
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay.
 3
               Did you find anything in the PNC
     documents that was helpful in support of
 4
     that assertion?
 5
               I don't recall.
 6
         Α
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 8
               Then in -- foreshadowing because
 9
     I gave the -- in MM19 --
10
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Which would
         then, Stephanie, be D2. I'll lose
11
12
         track soon, but that's D2. Thank you.
13
                (Whereupon, Postal Tracer
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000536, was
14
15
         marked as Defendants' Exhibit 2 for
         identification, as of this date.)
16
17
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
18
               What's this document? Can you
         Q
19
     see it?
20
         Α
               I can.
21
               Can I say "Mike" or do I need to
         Q
22
     say Agent --
               No. You can call me Mike.
23
         Α
     That's fine, sir.
24
25
               Thank you. Thank you.
         Q
```

```
Page 20
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
                This document is what?
 3
         Α
                I'm looking at a postal -- what
 4
     we call a postal tracer.
 5
         Q
               Okay.
 6
                And what is that?
 7
         Α
                It's a document that we present
 8
     The Post Office.
 9
         Q
               Okay.
10
                And we ask them to let us know
     whether mail is delivered to a given
11
12
     individual at a certain address.
13
         Q
               Okay.
14
               Now, are there any criteria for
15
     you being able to do that? Like you can't
16
     just do that, right? Is there -- you have
17
     to go through any kind of hoops to get to
     that, to request that postal tracer?
18
19
         Α
                There's no approval required --
20
               Not a --
         0
21
                -- for a postal tracer.
         Α
22
         Q
                I'm sorry to interrupt you.
23
     ahead.
               No approval for a postal tracer.
24
         Α
25
     It's within a revenue officer's authority
```

```
Page 21
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     to do that.
 3
         Q
               And what's the objective?
               I mean, it seems pretty obvious,
 5
     but just so -- when you read it on paper,
     it's different than what was in our minds.
 6
               So what's the objective of the
 8
     tracer?
               It's a tool used to ascertain
 9
         Α
     the residence or location of an
10
11
     individual.
12
               And in this instance, for what
         0
13
     purpose?
               To see if Shant Hovnanian
14
         Α
     received mail at 520 Navesink River Road.
15
     It's a Red Bank mailing address. Location
16
17
     is Middletown, New Jersey.
18
         Q
               Okay.
19
               And did you -- do you recall
20
     whether you found out the answer?
21
         Α
               The answer is this exhibit.
     says, "Mail is delivered to address
22
     given."
23
24
         Q
               Okay.
25
               And that's -- at that time,
```

Page 22 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 that's in 2016, yes? 3 My eyes are -- that does appear to be a six, yes. That appears to be '16. 5 Q My eyes, yes. All right, yes. 6 Okay. And was there any other postal 8 tracer that you issued? 9 Α Yeah. I recall some subsequent 10 postal tracers for -- or, you know, I 11 don't know if they were subsequent. I do 12 recall some additional postal tracers 13 being sent. 14 Q And do you know -- okay. 15 But they aren't a part of your file, I guess, or you don't --16 17 Α They would be in the collection 18 file, I would think. 19 They would? Yes. Okay. 20 Maybe we just don't have it for whatever 21 reason. 22 Do you recall whether there was 23 any point where mail or the box that said 24 that there was -- that other than mail was 25 delivered at this address given was

```
Page 23
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     checked on any of the subsequent tracers?
 3
               I don't believe so. I don't
     specifically recall.
 4
 5
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 6
               Now, going to MM -- this is
 7
     still part of 19, but it's out of order in
 8
     the context of the questioning, so just
 9
     bear with me because we talked about
10
     PNC -- we talked about PNC Bank and the
     production.
11
12
               And so there are a couple checks
13
     here that I just want to ask you about.
14
     This one in particular.
                               There's a
15
     cashier's check here.
16
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: And this is, I
17
         guess, D3, right, Stephanie?
18
                (Whereupon, Various Documents
19
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000537 through
20
         USAPROD-000543, were marked as
21
         Defendants' Exhibit 3 for
22
         identification, as of this date.)
23
               MR. KUNOFSKY: John, you said
         this was --
24
25
                                 I think it's 20
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
```

```
Page 24
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         now right.
                     It says 20 up on my screen
 3
         I think it was just mismarked on my
 4
         paper here. So anyway. All right.
 5
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
               So then I see a check here
 6
     for -- to the Township of Middletown,
 8
     319,349.49.
 9
               Is that the property tax check
10
     that you were talking about, a payment
11
     that you talked about earlier?
12
         Α
               Yes.
13
               Okay. Okay. Let me see what
     else is here.
14
15
               Do you recall whether there were
     any other checks from Zargis payable out
16
17
     in those -- into that type of an amount on
     behalf of Shant or whomever else that
18
19
     might have been paid on behalf of?
20
               Do you recall seeing anything
21
     else in there that struck you in that PNC
22
     production or in that --
               I don't recall.
23
         Α
24
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
               In 20, again, on page 2 here,
25
```

```
Page 25
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     there's the Township of Middletown Office
 3
     of Tax Collector. It's like a receipt,
 4
     yes?
 5
               Do you recall seeing this
 6
     document?
               "Statement of Taxes", it says.
               Does that look familiar at all?
 9
         Α
               I don't recall seeing this.
10
               At the bottom here, it says they
         0
11
     received a check for whatever amount -- in
12
     the amount of 319,349.49 for the
     redemption of a tax sale, certificate
13
14
     number so and so.
15
               Are you familiar with the tax
     sale process and real property collection?
16
17
         Α
               Yes.
18
         Q
               Okay.
19
               And so -- okay.
                                 It appears as
20
     if this check that satisfied the tax lien
21
     on the real estate, the real property tax
22
     lien came from this Zargis and was paid
23
     over to the Township and it released some
24
     tax sale certificates a private person had
25
     purchased.
```

```
Page 26
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
               Is that your understanding?
 3
         Α
               Yes.
         Q
               What did you -- as they say in
 5
     the movies, what did you make of that?
 6
               That payment had been made on
     behalf of Shant Hovnanian.
 8
         Q
               Okay.
 9
               And what's the significance of
10
     that, if any?
11
               It was a factor in our
12
     decision -- or my decision to request
13
     permission to record nominee -- a nominee
14
     lien.
               So -- and that's because Zargis
15
     paid on behalf of -- well, I mean, the
16
17
     owner on this -- let me just go back.
18
               The Certificate of Sale -- going
19
     back up to that page 2 that we talked
20
     about, the -- well, it looks like a
21
     receipt from the delicatessen, but it's
22
     from the Township of Middletown.
23
               I'm sorry for my little jokes.
24
     I'm usually entertaining myself.
25
               But the Statement of Taxes says
```

```
Page 27
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
     the owner's name is Pachava Asset Trust,
 3
     yes?
         Α
                That's what it says, yes.
 5
         Q
                Okay.
 6
                And so then the payment came
     from Zargis on behalf of Pachava Asset
 8
             And you're saying that that's for
     the benefit of Shant and that that formed
 9
     at least one of the criteria or one of the
10
11
     bases for the assertion of a nominee lien?
12
         Α
               Yes.
13
                Did Shant own Zargis?
         Q
14
         Α
                That was my understanding.
15
               How did you come to that
         Q
     understanding?
16
17
         Α
                I believe it was from bank
     records and tax returns.
18
19
         Q
                Okay.
20
                For Zargis or for Shant or do
21
     you know?
22
         Α
                I'm trying to recall. I think I
23
     remember speaking with someone who advised
24
     that Shant owned Zargis. My memory is
25
     failing there.
```

```
Page 28
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 3
               And so they -- and him having
     the -- if he controlled it, him having the
 5
     company pay a property tax liability on
     behalf of the trust would be the basis
 6
     that you're setting forth, or at least one
     of the bases for pursuing the nominee lien
     claim?
 9
10
         Α
               Yes.
11
               Did you -- did he have any
12
     other -- did Shant have any other assets
13
     that you were able to find or able to --
14
     you know, that you were able to find in
15
     your -- I mean, I know that you said that
     the -- I'm going to shortcut because I'm a
16
17
     tax lawyer, but the 433 is the financial
18
     statements, so to speak.
19
               Those weren't provided to you,
20
     so you then had to go out and do the
21
     digging yourself.
22
               And so did you find any other
23
     assets of Shant's in there -- in your
24
     search?
25
         Α
               Not really. I want to say we
```

Page 29 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 may have uncovered some IRA accounts with 3 very small balances I recall seeing in the history, but nothing of any substance. 5 Could you discern whether he had 6 any visible means of support? That's such a lawyer question, 8 but you know what I'm saying. 9 Α Through monies flowing into 10 businesses that he owned. That was all 11 that I can recall. 12 Q Okay. 13 And I don't have a plan for 14 this, but before you answer, wait for 15 Mr. Kunofsky or Ms. Coppler to chime, 16 okay. 17 But do you know whether -- and I can't tell from the file. 18 19 Do you know whether the Criminal 20 Investigations Division of the service was 21 ever -- ever looked at the file at any 22 point? 23 MR. KUNOFSKY: I'm objecting. 24 And you are instructed not to 25 answer that question. That's --

```
Page 30
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
 3
               And the only reason I ask, just
         so -- for foundational purposes, if it
 4
 5
         ever is an issue, is that there are
         portions of your -- of the record that
 6
 7
         are redacted based upon
 8
         attorney-client, and so I'm just more
 9
         than curious. So --
10
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Attorney-client
         is not quite the same, but I'm going
11
12
         to instruct him not to answer that
13
         question.
14
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 No, I
15
         understand. No, and I'm not
         suggesting that that's the basis for
16
17
         your instruction. I probably
18
         understand the basis for your
19
         instruction.
                      Okay.
20
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
                               It's that he
21
         could not comment on criminal matters,
22
         and so he essentially -- so he cannot
23
         comment one way or the other, and
24
         nothing should be read from my
25
         objection.
                      There's no need for him to
```

```
Page 31
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         discuss criminal files in this matter,
 3
         to the extent they exist.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes, okay.
 5
         Okay.
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
         0
               And so -- all right.
 8
                Let's go through some of this
 9
     other paperwork to the extent that it
               We have a lot of paper.
10
     matters.
                                          I just
     want to try and figure out what might
11
12
     matter, obviously.
13
               Moving to 24 here, which is my
14
     24.
          Let me just see what that translates
15
     into.
16
                (Whereupon, Response to Summons
17
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000785 through
18
         USAPROD-000800, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 4 for
19
20
         identification, as of this date.)
21
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
22
         0
                This is a document -- can you
23
     see the document up?
24
         Α
                I can see it.
25
                Jerry Hillman, LLC, Tax Prep
         Q
```

Page 32 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Services, Village Mall; do you know what 3 this document is? This is addressed to you, right? 4 5 Α It is. This is a letter from a tenant 6 7 at the Village Mall. I believe he 8 provided this in response to a summons. 9 Actually, it says right on it. And he's 10 providing information about his rental of the unit. 11 12 Q Okay. 13 I mean, in the context of the 14 summons, I agree with you; it says it 15 right in it. I don't have the summons, though. 16 17 It appears as if you may have asked a few questions here, right? 18 19 you back into what you might have asked? 20 Obviously, you asked for a 21 lease. You asked --22 Α Well --23 -- whether it was a renewal or 0 24 what's the current status, what the -- and 25 then can you go from there based upon what

Page 33 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 his responses are? 3 Α He's indicating that he's month-to-month on the lease, that until 5 January of 2017, rental checks were made payable to Vahak Hovnanian. 6 Q Okay. Α From February 2017 thereafter, 9 rental checks were made payable to Hovsat, 10 Incorporated, and his contact is Karen Gandolfo. 11 12 And then he says, "And just for 0 13 the record," which is -- do you think that this is gratuitous, or is this in the --14 15 he said, "I've never heard of Shant 16 Hovnanian." 17 Is this a -- is that gratuitous or is that in response to a question that 18 19 you may have asked? 20 I likely asked. I spoke with 21 some of the tenants and asked who the 22 landlord was. I may have asked Mr. Hillman if Shant was the landlord. I 23 24 don't specifically recall. 25 Did you ever meet with any of Q

```
Page 34
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     the tenants, including Mr. Hillman?
 3
         Α
               Yes.
               Who did you meet with, if you
         Q
     recall?
 5
                I met with Mr. Hillman at one
 6
         Α
             There was a -- two medical
     point.
     offices, a hairdresser, and a woman named
 9
     Viro (phonetic), I think her name was.
10
         Q
               Okay.
11
                Is that it? What's the -- what
12
     did the plaza look like?
13
                I don't know what the office
     plaza looked like. So there were four
14
15
     different --
               Yeah. There were like office
16
         Α
17
     suites.
18
               Okay.
         Q
19
         Α
               Like business office suites.
20
               And maybe, what, four or five of
         Q
21
     them?
22
                The ones that I just -- yeah,
23
     that I just said.
24
               Yes. And -- okay.
         Q
25
                And was Hovsat there; do you
```

Page 35 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Hovsat, Inc., who he refers to in 3 this later? My understanding -- I'm sorry. Α 5 Q No, no. You go. 6 My understanding is that the business office for multiple Hovnanian-related business entities was at 8 9 this address, so that would include 10 Hovsat. 11 Is that -- from your perspective 12 and respecting the guidelines that you're subject to, is that a problem in this 13 14 case? 15 Does that reflect anything, you know, that you have a number of entities 16 17 sharing the same space in the same 18 building complex or whatever? Is that any 19 indicator in your mind of anything 20 relative to Shant or these entities? 21 You're asking the simple matter Α 22 of just multiple business entities at one location? 23 In this case. I don't think 24 25 you're allowed to answer the -- what

Page 36 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 you're suggesting. 3 But in this case, did it make any difference? 4 5 I don't believe so, no. No. 6 Q Okay. So it was a nonevent that they 8 were all together in this one suite, in 9 your mind? 10 In my mind, it's not of 11 consequence. 12 It was not -- and further down 0 13 that road, so was it any part of your decision-making or was it -- did it form 14 15 any part of any basis or the basis for any piece of asserting a nominee lien? 16 17 Α The fact that multiple business entities were headquartered at this one 18 19 location, in my mind, played no role in my 20 decision-making. 21 Q Okay. 22 You know, then I don't need 23 to -- then I don't need to go through all of that documentation relative to the 24 25 leases and where the rent went and

```
Page 37
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     whatever else in that scenario, which is
 3
     helpful.
               It's helpful for the balance of
     your day, my day, everybody's day. All
 4
 5
     right.
 6
               So in -- that's my MM21.
 7
     This is MM21.
 8
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: And, again,
 9
         I've already lost track on the D
10
         numbers. 5, I'll just give you.
11
                (Whereupon, Response to Summons
12
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000544 through
13
         USAPROD-000566, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 5 for
14
15
         identification, as of this date.)
16
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
17
               And so this -- do you recognize
         0
     this correspondence?
18
19
               I know it's written to some
20
     other revenue officer, but somebody that
21
     was a part of your group in this case.
22
         Α
               That appears to be a cover
23
     letter from Morgan Stanley with bank
     records underneath it.
24
25
         Q
               Okay.
```

```
Page 38
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               And then the re: on this, Mike,
 3
     is "In the matter of Shant Hovnanian,"
             Is that how this case was
 4
     right?
 5
     designated internally?
 6
         Α
               Yes.
         Q
               Okay.
               And then there are a series of
 8
 9
     checks I'm going through. Here's one
10
     for -- and I think that Mr. Kunofsky
11
     brought up this check in the context of a
12
     deposition of Ms. Gandolfo.
                                   It's a check
13
     payable to the Ranney School for $41,000.
14
               Did that check strike you, get
15
     your attention in this production, or did
     you see these documents? I know that they
16
17
     were addressed to your coworker,
18
     Ms. Troichuk, but did you see them?
19
         Α
               Yes, I did see these.
20
               Do you remember this check in
         0
21
     particular?
22
               Not specifically, but I can see
     what it is.
23
24
         Q
               Okay.
25
               And this is a check from -- it
```

```
Page 39
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     appears as if it's a check made out -- and
 3
     then I'm just looking at the actual
     physical check itself -- SpeedusNY.com,
 5
     and then Shant's name underneath, right,
     on the face of the check?
         Α
               Yes.
 8
         Q
               Okay.
 9
               Do you -- what do you know about
10
     SpeedusNY.com, L.P., if anything?
11
               That it's a company owned by
12
     Shant Hovnanian.
               It is -- he does own Speedus?
13
         Q
14
     Okay.
15
               And do you know what Speedus --
16
               That's my recollection, yeah.
         Α
17
         Q
               Okay.
18
               I knew of it -- I've read and
19
     seen a Speedus, Inc. I didn't know
     SpeedusNY.com, L.P. Maybe that's the
20
21
     legal name.
22
               I had heard along the way this
23
     was publicly traded.
24
               Is that consistent with your
25
     recollection?
```

```
Page 40
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                My recollection is that there
 3
     were two entities.
 4
         Q
                Okay.
 5
                Speedus was publicly traded at
 6
     one time.
         Q
                Okay.
 8
         Α
                I don't believe SpeedusNY.com
 9
     was.
10
                Do you know what SpeedusNY.com
         0
           Were you able to dig around and find
11
12
     out anything about that?
                I don't recall.
13
         Α
14
         Q
                Okay. Okay.
15
                There's another check here
     for -- it looks like Dr. Katz, right?
16
17
     don't these seem -- these seem a little
     bit as if they might be personal expenses;
18
19
     do you think?
20
                They do strike me as personal
21
     expenses.
22
         0
                Do you recall whether that was
23
     any kind of red flag for you in this
24
     process, that there --
25
                That was a factor.
         Α
                                     I believe
```

```
Page 41
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     that was a factor, I believe, in a request
 3
     I made to survey nominee levy.
               At Morgan Stanley?
         Q
 5
         Α
               I believe so, yes.
               What was the result of the
 6
         0
 7
     request for the nominee levy?
               The Office of Chief Counsel --
 8
         Α
 9
     Ari is speaking, but his mute is on.
10
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Oh, yes.
                                            All
11
         right. Go ahead. I'm sorry.
12
                               Sorry, I've got a
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
13
         dog who barks in the background, so
14
         sometimes I may just hold up my hands.
15
               Mike, I'm going to instruct that
         you cannot -- you can tell the --
16
17
         whether a levy issued. You can't say
18
         anything about the process as that
19
         involves attorney-client.
20
         carefully, you can answer that
21
         question because it was just --
22
               THE WITNESS: I understand.
23
         Α
               Based on my recollection, a
24
     nominee levy was served.
25
         Q
               It was served.
                                Okay.
                                        Okay.
```

```
Page 42
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               And that was relative to Shant
 3
     Hovnanian, to SpeedusNY.com, L.P., both?
         Α
               The levy was served at Morgan
 4
 5
     Stanley.
 6
         Q
               Okay.
               I believe attached funds in this
 8
     account.
 9
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
10
               Oh, so there was just one
     account there potentially?
11
12
         Α
               I don't recall.
13
               Okay. Okay. All right.
         Q
14
               Then there's a series. I'm just
15
     going through the document.
                                   There are a
     series of line items and transactions
16
17
     through here. Okay.
               What was the total amounts of
18
19
     the four years of liability for Shant?
20
     you remember the tax? I mean, interest
21
     and penalty doesn't matter, but do you
22
     remember even on a napkin basis what the
23
     total liability was?
24
               I really don't recall any
25
                 I know it was in the millions.
     specifics.
```

Page 43 1 MACGILLIVRAY Q Okay. 3 And what did it stem from? you know where the liability originated? 4 5 Not the years or the tax return, but the 6 type of -- you know, was it wrong deductions? Was it shelter? Was it --8 Α Yeah, again, I was not involved in the audit process or the tax court 9 10 I really can't comment on -- I 11 have no direct knowledge of that. 12 Did you think that Shant was one 0 13 of the bad guys in this world? 14 Α I make no judgment on the man or 15 his character. This process of seeking other 16 17 ways of obtaining the information and other ways of obtaining assets 18 19 potentially, was that all as a result of 20 what may have been a failure to cooperate 21 on the part of Shant? 22 Α Certainly, if Mr. Hovnanian had 23 provided financial records and sought a 24 resolution, searching elsewhere may not 25 have been required.

```
Page 44
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                Was there any formal dialogue
         0
 3
     about resolution in this case at any
     point?
 4
 5
               I recall seeing in the
     history -- I believe I spoke with
 6
     Mr. Rankin at one point. I -- you know, I
 8
     really don't recall. I'm sorry.
 9
               Did you know the Hovnanian name
         Q
10
     from being in the community there?
11
                It's a famous name from the --
12
     as builders in the area.
13
         Q
               Right.
14
               And then the people always
15
     remind me that there's famous and then
     infamous.
16
17
                Do you know which one -- which
18
     did you see?
19
         Α
               Really neither.
20
         Q
               Okay.
21
                So you didn't have any
22
     preconceived notions about Shant or the
23
     family or whatever else one way or the
     other?
24
25
         Α
               No.
```

```
Page 45
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 3
               So that certainly wasn't a
     factor in the process of seeking the
 4
 5
     nominee lien, then, right?
               What wasn't a factor?
 6
         Α
         Q
               That -- who he was. Not that
 8
     that's a big deal, but you know what I'm
 9
     saying, in a small community.
10
         Α
               No, sir.
11
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
12
               Was there any -- and this is
     relative to my client, so I think it's
13
14
     okay.
15
               Was there any other tax history
     with Shant in your files that was
16
17
     reflected in your file? Did you have any
     other collection history with him other
18
     than this?
19
20
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
                               I'm going to
21
         object. Vague to the word "you," if
22
         that helps with the question, John.
23
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes, I'm just
24
         trying to stay within the parameters
25
         of the chief counsel's memo, and so
```

```
Page 46
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         I'm trying to make it specific to this
 3
         case and his knowledge as opposed to
         generally. So if I ask about it in
 5
         the office, I think that's a problem.
         And so I'm trying to say --
 6
 7
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Right.
 8
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: -- did your
 9
         file reflect that he had any other
10
         history of tax delinquency or
         collection efforts on the part of the
11
12
         service. That's --
13
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Okay.
14
               That -- for Shant, I think that
15
         question is -- all right.
16
               Can you, please, reask the
17
         question? I'm sorry.
18
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: I think
19
         Stephanie has to repeat it.
20
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
                               That's fine.
21
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: I don't have a
22
         script.
               (Record read.)
23
24
               MR. KUNOFSKY: You can answer.
25
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Is that all
```

```
Page 47
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         right, Ari, or no?
                MR. KUNOFSKY: I think that's
 3
         fine. I think he can answer that.
 4
 5
                MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                  Okay.
 6
                I do not recall any prior
     collection history with Mr. Hovnanian
     before this case.
 8
 9
         Q
                Okay.
10
                Did that come up?
11
                There appears to be a summons
12
     issued.
13
                (Whereupon, Summons
14
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000890 through
15
         USAPROD-000937, was marked as
16
         Defendants' Exhibit 6 for
17
         identification, as of this date.)
18
                Yes, sir.
         Α
19
                Again, in the matter of Shant
20
     Hovnanian, right?
21
         Α
                Yes, sir.
22
         0
                And this is addressed to whom?
23
         Α
                This is to New Jersey American
24
     Water.
25
                Okay.
         Q
```

```
Page 48
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               And for what?
                              For --
 3
         Α
               This summons seeks information
     about, basically, who was paying the water
 4
 5
     bills.
 6
         0
               And what did you want to know
     for?
 8
         Α
               Payment of expenses associated
 9
     with the property would have a bearing on
10
     our -- on my decision to request
     permission to file a nominee lien on the
11
12
     property.
13
               In the process of doing that, I
         Q
     see a series of summonses directed.
14
15
     it seems as if that's the objective, is to
     try to and discern, you know, who might be
16
17
     doing what, as if I would say like going
18
     through the front door as an option had
19
     already been dismissed.
               Had that been dismissed?
20
21
     mean, was there an investigation -- was
22
     there a conclusion with respect to Shant
23
     early on, and then the nominee lien was
24
     the -- was going to be the effort
25
     thereafter?
```

Page 49 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Because this time frame seems 3 relatively short. We're still in 2017 when I see this summons and some of the 4 5 others. So --6 MR. KUNOFSKY: Before you answer, I'm going to instruct you that 8 you cannot answer as to general 9 techniques or methods of the IRS in collection, but you can answer in this 10 11 case to the -- yes, you can answer for 12 this case. I don't want a waiver of -- I 13 14 don't want him to be able to answer a 15 question of this is how we do our 16 audits, this is how we investigate, 17 this is what we go through. 18 I'm not sure what the front door 19 is, but when we go through the front 20 door and when we go through whatever 21 the side door is here. He can talk 22 about this case. He can't talk about 23 the general techniques because that 24 would -- to the extent those aren't 25 already in public documents, that

Page 50 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 discloses our techniques for examining 3 nominees and alter egos. You may answer the question with 5 those instructions. 6 In this case, at this juncture, a determination to request permission to file a nominee lien had not been made. 8 9 Q Had not been made. Okav. 10 Α I -- not with any finality. 11 0 Okay. 12 And, you know, the reason I ask 13 is because in a normal collection process, 14 from my perspective of 32 years of seeing it, is that you're looking for sources of 15 revenue, not necessarily sources of 16 17 expense, right, to expend -- to direct your efforts. 18 19 And so these summonses to banks 20 are sources of revenue. The summonses to 21 American Water and utilities and other 22 third-party providers are expense items, 23 and so that -- to me, it seemed as if 24 that's a time in which you're seeking to 25 determine, you know, whether there's some

```
Page 51
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     underlying ownership issues like you're
 3
     describing in the nominee context.
                Is that a fair assessment of
 5
     what was happening here?
               Let me --
 6
         Α
         0
                I know it's a lot of narrative.
 8
         Α
                Yes, there was a lot there, so I
 9
     don't want to just --
10
                In a normal course, you --
         0
11
                Let me say this:
                                  What we were
12
     trying to do at this juncture was to
     determine who was paying the expenses
13
14
     associated with the property.
15
               And for what purpose?
         0
                To ascertain if there was a link
16
17
     between the expenses paid and Shant
18
     Hovnanian.
19
               Okay. Okay.
                              Thank you on that.
20
     Let me get back to this.
21
                Oh, Mike, do you need a break?
22
         Α
               I'm good.
23
         Q
               You good?
24
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Anybody?
25
         Α
                I've got my water with me and
```

```
Page 52
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     I'm good to go.
 3
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                Does anybody
         need any break or anything? Are we
 4
 5
         all right? Everybody all right?
 6
               MR. KUNOFSKY: I'm good.
 7
         me one second.
 8
               Let me just put it on the record
 9
         so that it's clear. I'm going to,
10
         now, mute my line and Cat will take
11
         over as counsel for the United States,
12
         as we previously agreed with John, due
         to the technical difficulties we had
13
         at the start here.
14
15
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
16
               MS. COPPLER:
                             I'm just
17
         connecting my speaker right now.
                                             Can
18
         everybody hear me all right?
19
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                Yes.
20
               MS. COPPLER: Very good.
                                          Thank
21
         you.
22
                (Whereupon, Response to Summons
23
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000567 through
         USAPROD-000649, was marked as
24
25
         Defendants' Exhibit 7 for
```

```
Page 53
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         identification, as of this date.)
 3
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 4
         Q
               Okay, and the next one, same
 5
     thing here, Mike: summons, subpoena, New
 6
     Jersey Natural Gas.
               Same objective as far as
     determining whether there was a tie-in
 8
 9
     between the payment of expenses and Shant
     Hovnanian?
10
11
               This inquiry was to determine
12
     who was paying expenses to New Jersey
     Natural Gas associated with 520 Navesink
13
14
     River Road.
15
         Q
               Okay.
               And what did you -- there are
16
17
     two service addresses here, right, 520
     Navesink River Road and then 520B Navesink
18
19
     River Road.
20
               Do you know why? Were there two
21
     properties or two --
22
         Α
               That was their response.
23
         Q
               Okay.
24
               Did that have any meaning to
25
     you?
```

```
Page 54
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               I don't know for sure.
     believe at that address there was a main
 3
     house and a smaller house. My belief --
 4
 5
         Q
               Go ahead. I'm sorry.
 6
         Α
               My belief is that the 520 is the
     big house and 520B is the smaller house.
 8
         Q
               And it seems like they both
 9
     had -- they had separate accounts, but
10
     both in the name of Vahak Hovnanian,
     right?
11
12
         Α
               That's what the letter
13
     indicates, yes.
14
         Q
               And do you know who Vahak was?
15
               My understanding is that is
         Α
     Shant Hovnanian's father.
16
17
               Okay. Okay.
         Q
18
               Let me see what this 30 is.
19
                (Whereupon, Affinity Federal
20
         Credit Union Records Bates-stamped
21
         USAPROD-000858 through USAPROD-000889,
22
         were marked as Defendants' Exhibit 8
23
         for identification, as of this date.)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
24
25
               Affinity Federal Credit Union;
         Q
```

Page 55 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 do you see this document? What is this 3 document? This appears to be a cover Α 5 letter from Affinity Federal Credit Union. I would say there were bank records 6 attached. 8 Q And do you recall what is the 9 relationship with Affinity -- was it 10 Shant's relationship with Affinity Federal 11 Credit Union? 12 Α My recollection is that Hovsat 13 maintained an account with Affinity. 14 Q Yes, and that's the second page. It's not a trick. I just -- this is the 15 order in which they're in. Right, Hovsat. 16 17 And then who was Hovsat? 18 As I recall, Hovsat had paid Α 19 expenses associated with the Village Mall 20 property. 21 Q Okay. 22 MS. COPPLER: I apologize for interrupting, but could you, please, 23 clarify which exhibit you're asking 24 25 about?

```
Page 56
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: You're a little
 3
         faint, Cat.
               MS. COPPLER: I apologize.
 5
               I just asked whether you could,
 6
         please, clarify which exhibit you're
 7
         showing currently.
 8
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes.
                                       I was
 9
         just going to ask Stephanie. You're
10
         keeping track, right?
11
               THE COURT REPORTER:
12
         Exhibit 8, which is the document
         labeled MM30.
13
14
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: You good, Cat?
15
         You all right?
16
               MS. COPPLER:
                            Yes.
                                    Thank you.
17
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
18
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
19
               And so then -- okay, so Hovsat,
20
     Inc., and you're trying to -- in this
21
     instance, what were you looking for here
22
     from Affinity, to see what?
23
               We were looking for records that
         Α
24
     showed payment of expenses associated with
25
     the Village Mall property.
```

```
Page 57
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay.
 3
               And there's a -- it's like an
     account application, depository
 4
 5
     authorization. And page 3 is the
     signature line, and it looks like Antranik
     Sarkes.
               Do you know who that is?
 9
         Α
               My understanding is that he was
10
     a former employee, I believe.
11
               Did you talk to him or interview
12
     him in this process?
               I don't believe so.
13
         Α
14
         Q
               And this appears as if there --
15
     an addendum to business membership
     application to add and/or remove
16
17
     authorized representatives.
                                   And it
18
     appears we have Karen Gandolfo and then,
19
     again, Antranik Sarkes, and then Arthur
20
     Havighorst.
21
               Do you know who that was?
                                            Is
22
     that name familiar?
               I recall the name. I believe he
23
         Α
24
     was a former employee.
25
               Did you interview him at all at
         Q
```

Page 58 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 any point or anybody -- when I say "you," 3 I'm talking about the collective "you," right, each of the three revenue officers 4 5 for this purpose, right? I don't recall. 6 Α MR. HANAMIRIAN: And, Cat, is 8 that okay under the chief counsel's 9 memo when we're talking about this, 10 when we establish that there's kind of 11 a team effort, when I'm asking the 12 question, I'm asking about this 13 investigation, whether he got the 14 document or whether one of the other 15 two got the document and he saw it? 16 MS. COPPLER: Yes, he is 17 permitted to speak about -- if he says 18 that he has knowledge of it, he is 19 permitted to speak about the 20 investigation in this matter whether 21 it was him or any of his colleagues 22 doing the work. 23 MR. HANAMIRIAN: Okay. 24 I just want to make sure we stay 25 on the right -- doing the right thing.

```
Page 59
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MS. COPPLER:
                             Yes.
                                    Thank you.
 3
         We appreciate it.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes, yes, yes.
 5
         All right.
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
               Driver's license for each of
         0
 8
            Pretty boring stuff. Okay.
 9
     corporate income tax return to date.
10
               Do you know if this is -- I'm
     showing this page here, this page 20 of
11
12
            There's a front page of an 1120 for
     MM30.
13
     Hovsat, but nothing else.
14
               Do you recall seeing this?
15
               I can't specifically call --
         Α
     recall this return, but I can say that I
16
17
     did obtain returns associated with many of
     the business entities associated with
18
19
     Shant Hovnanian.
20
               And did you talk to
21
     anybody at -- there's an identified --
22
     there's a preparer down here, paid
23
     preparer for Hovsat, so the Schonbraun
24
     McCann Group.
25
               Did you speak to anybody there?
```

```
Page 60
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
               Not that I recall.
         Α
 3
         Q
               Did you speak to any preparers,
     tax preparers, professional --
 4
 5
     professionals?
 6
               Other than Mr. Rankin, who you
     spoke to at the outset, did you speak to
 8
     any of the professionals for any of these
 9
     entities that -- where you were seeking
     information and/or for Shant?
10
11
         Α
               Not that I recall.
12
         Q
               Did you try to speak to any of
13
     those persons?
14
               Not that I recall.
         Α
15
               Okay. Let's move on.
         Q
16
                (Whereupon, Various Documents
17
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000775 through
18
         USAPROD-000784, were marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 9 for
19
20
         identification, as of this date.)
21
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
22
         0
               All right, now, we're looking at
     MM23, and there's a covering letter from
23
24
     the Village Mall.
25
               Do you know what this document
```

```
Page 61
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     is?
 3
         Α
                This is a letter from Ms. Diane
     Lavin of the Hair Control business at the
 5
     Village Mall.
 6
         Q
               Okay.
               And then she's writing to -- I
 8
     went the wrong way here. She's writing
 9
     to -- well, actually, they're writing to
10
     her, right?
11
                So it seems like the
12
     landlord's --
13
                Yeah, can I see the first page
14
     again, please?
15
               Yes.
         Q
                      Sure.
16
         Α
                Thank you.
17
                I thought you were done.
         Q
     why I skipped forward. I didn't realize.
18
     Go ahead.
19
                Yeah, this looks like it's a
20
21
     letter to her as a tenant.
22
                And then the letter -- this is
23
     page 2 of the letter.
24
                It appears it's signed by Arthur
25
     Havighorst again, right?
```

```
Page 62
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               Yes. He's signing for the
 3
     landlord.
         Q
 4
               Okay.
 5
               This is from 2005, right?
 6
         Α
               Yeah. I -- yeah.
 7
         Q
               Okay.
 8
               And do you recall why that came
 9
         Was that her -- did Ms. Lavin just
     up?
10
     produce these documents and just give up
11
     all of these files or something?
12
         Α
                    As I recall, we requested a
               No.
     copy of the lease, you know, copies of
13
     checks paid to the landlord; things of
14
15
     that nature.
               Okay. And this kind of came up,
16
17
     then.
            Okay.
18
               And, here, it appears to be a
19
     check from Hair Control from April of '17,
20
     payable to whom?
21
               I'm having trouble seeing.
22
               Hovsat? Is that what you see?
               That's what it looks like.
23
         Α
24
               Okay. For $700. Okay, so she's
         Q
25
     paying directly to Hovsat.
```

```
Page 63
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               And it looks like each of these
 3
     that follow -- well, this one -- can you
     tell what this one says?
 4
 5
               Is that V. Hovnanian on this
 6
     payable, on this -- this is page --
         Α
               That looks --
               -- 8 of document MM23.
               That appears to be V. Hovnanian.
 9
         Α
10
     I had to turn my glasses to read that.
11
               Well, I'm with you.
                                     So I'm
12
     looking at, like, a Mac. I'm looking at a
13
     Mac screen that's about the size of a
14
     room, right, and I'm still having trouble.
15
               So maybe that's Vahak, V.,
     right, and again here, and then again
16
17
     here?
18
               Okay. Let's get out of that.
19
                (Whereupon, Response to Subpoena
20
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000938 through
21
         USAPROD-000997, was marked as
22
         Defendants' Exhibit 10 for
23
         identification, as of this date.)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
24
25
               Same thing.
                             This is MM31.
         Q
```

```
Page 64
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     Again, addressed to Revenue Officer
 3
     Troichuk.
               Can you tell me what this
 5
     document is?
 6
               This appears to be a letter from
 7
     FirstEnergy indicating that -- it's a
 8
     cover letter providing information
 9
     requested by summons.
10
               And as we go down in the
     document, there appear to be -- there are
11
12
     a series of checks at page 2.
13
               And can you see who that -- now,
14
     it's not just that we have to see it, but
15
     we have to look -- tilt our heads over to
     see it because it's -- right?
16
17
               It appears to be a check paid to
         Α
     JCP&L for the, I guess, electrical
18
19
     expenses of the Village Mall property.
20
         Q
               Okay.
21
               And this is from 2016, right?
22
         Α
               This does appear to be, yes.
23
               So -- okay. Okay, so let's get
         0
24
     out of that one.
25
                (Whereupon, Response to Subpoena
```

```
Page 65
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000650 through
 3
         USAPROD-000687, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 11 for
 5
         identification, as of this date.)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
         0
               Number 35, MM35.
 8
               Mike, what's this document, if
 9
     you know?
               This is a cover letter from
10
     New Jersey American Water --
11
12
         Q
               Okay.
13
               -- providing documents
     associated with 520 Navesink River Road.
14
15
               Okay. And then we go down.
     This is the eye test.
16
17
         Α
               Whoa.
               The only reason I wanted to
18
         Q
19
     ask -- the only thing I want you to see
20
     here is that -- what I'm trying to get out
21
     of this is that the customer account
22
     identification on the left-hand corner,
23
     when you tilt your head to the left, the
24
     first line appears there's a name there.
25
               Can you see the name?
```

Page 66 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 I can't. I can't make it out. 3 I'm sorry. That's all right. That's all Q 5 It says Vahak Hovnanian is the 6 account holder. Okay. Let's get out of that? 8 Those inquiries that went out to the various utilities and to the tenants 9 10 and to the banks, did that yield anything 11 that affected your determination to assert 12 a nominee lien on the trust assets, each or both of the trust assets? 13 14 Α I believe those inquiries 15 provided records that showed payment to the utilities through businesses owned by 16 17 Shant Hovnanian. 18 Shant alone or Shant with others Q 19 or you don't know or you know? 20 Α I don't recall. 21 Q Okay. 22 But you do recall that he had an 23 ownership interest in some of those entities, right? 24 25 I mean, we're talking Yeah. Α

Page 67 MACGILLIVRAY 1 2 about several entities at this point, so 3 I'm a little confused. Q Understood. 5 No, no, no. I'm just talking in that sense, right, we're talking about the 6 banks and the utilities and whatever else 8 that the payment by these other entities, 9 Hovsat or -- okay. 10 Let's go back here a little bit 11 in MM04.12 (Whereupon, Deed Bates-stamped 13 USAPROD-000300 through USAPROD-000334, were marked as Defendants' Exhibit 12 14 15 for identification, as of this date.) BY MR. HANAMIRIAN: 16 17 Do you recognize this document? Q Take a second look and look. 18 19 Do you know what it is? 20 It is a deed. Α 21 And what's the significance of Q 22 this deed in this case? It's a deed wherein Paris 23 Α Hovnanian transferred the Middletown 24 25 property to the Shant S. Hovnanian Asset

```
Page 68
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     Trust for the sum of $1.
 3
         Q
               Okay.
                And what did that -- did that
 5
     have any meaning to you?
                And while you're thinking about
 6
     it, it's the -- we told earlier there was
     520 and 520B Navesink River Road.
 8
 9
     appears to relate just to 520 unless it's
10
     a single deed for both properties, but I
11
     don't know.
12
               And Paris Hasmig Hovnanian is --
13
     do you know who that is?
14
         Α
                      It's Shant Hovnanian's
               Yes.
15
     mother.
16
               Mother.
                         Okay.
         Q
17
                And so this deed transfers that
     property to the Shant Hovnanian Asset
18
19
     Trust.
20
         Α
                Yes.
21
               And the trustee appears to be
         Q
22
     Hilde Jenssen Hovnanian.
23
                Do you know who that is?
                I believe that's Shant
24
         Α
25
     Hovnanian's ex-wife.
```

```
Page 69
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay.
 3
               Now, in -- let's go to the next.
     Let's go to MM5.
 4
 5
                (Whereupon, Corrective Deed
 6
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000335 through
         USAPROD-000339, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 13 for
 8
 9
         identification, as of this date.)
10
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
11
               Do you see this document titled
     "Corrective Deed"?
12
13
         Α
               I do.
14
               Do you know what this document
         Q
15
     represents?
               It represents transfer of
16
17
     property from the Shant S. Hovnanian Asset
18
     Trust to the Pachava Asset Trust.
19
               And was there any significant --
20
     this is from January or December depending
     on what's -- it looks like it filed in
21
22
     December, maybe. And then the other stamp
23
     is the recorded, maybe, January 4, 2012.
24
     Who knows? But, in any event, it's 2011
25
     or early 2012.
```

```
Page 70
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                Did you attach any significance
 3
     to this deed, this corrective deed?
         Α
                In and of itself -- in and of
 4
 5
     itself, no, other than --
 6
         Q
               Go ahead.
                           I'm sorry.
         Α
               Other than it's a transfer for a
 8
     dollar.
 9
         Q
               Okay.
10
                And so standing in and of itself
     is the same to you as standing alone?
11
12
     Does that mean the same to you as on its
13
     own?
14
                So if it was combined with
15
     something, to me, that indicates -- if it
     was combined with something else, it had
16
17
     some meaning to you; is that correct?
18
                What I'm saying is -- you're
         Α
19
     asking me about this deed.
20
         0
                Yes.
21
               And as I look at this deed,
         Α
22
     based on just the deed alone, there was no
23
     major significance.
24
         Q
               Okay.
25
                           No, you know, again,
                Yes, yes.
```

Page 71 MACGILLIVRAY 1 2 this is the lawyer thing, right, is that 3 we hear. We hear the words and we think that they all have meaning, so that's why I'm asking you. 5 6 Okay. The MM07. (Whereupon, Trust Agreement Amendment Bates-stamped USAPROD-000342 9 through USAPROD-000344, was marked as Defendants' Exhibit 14 for 10 11 identification, as of this date.) 12 BY MR. HANAMIRIAN: 13 Q Do you recognize this document? 14 Α This document appears to be an 15 amended trust agreement. And do you know what the 16 17 amendment was for? 18 Just so you have everything that 19 you need, let me go to pages 2 and 3 of 20 that same Exhibit 7, MM07, and you can see 21 that page 2 is a signature line and page 3 22 is what we call a jurat, or the notary 23 witnessing stuff. So there's nothing 24 substantive on any subsequent page just so 25 you're getting the full picture in your

```
Page 72
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     answer.
 3
               Did this document have any
     meaning to you? Did you understand what
 4
 5
     this document was?
               And when I say "was," I mean
 6
     it's a part of your file, so at some point
 8
     it came into you.
               I believe this is a document
 9
         Α
10
     where they changed the name of the trust
11
     from the Shant Hovnanian Asset Trust to
12
     the Pachava Asset Trust.
13
         Q
               Okay.
14
               And that may be that -- would
15
     that maybe have precipitated the
     corrective deed?
16
17
               MS. COPPLER: Objection. Calls
         for speculation.
18
19
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
20
               MS. COPPLER:
                             You can answer.
21
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: I'll withdraw
22
         it.
23
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
24
         Q
               You okay, Mike?
25
         Α
               Yeah, okay. Just shifted.
```

```
Page 73
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               I'm guessing that we're closer
         0
 3
     to the same ages because I'm making noise
     when I move around too, so -- it's a good
 4
 5
            It's a good age. Whatever it is,
 6
     we're not saying.
                (Whereupon, Deed Bates-stamped
 8
         USAPROD-000415 through USAPROD-000418,
         was marked as Defendants' Exhibit 15
 9
10
         for identification, as of this date.)
11
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
12
               MM15, this looks like another
         0
13
            This is interesting because, you
14
     know, whoever drew this up is -- well,
15
     actually, it looks like a nice form,
     right, up in the left-hand, but this deed
16
17
     is made on January 1, 2105, which is
     probably not right. So let's say that's
18
19
     2015, maybe, given the stamp.
20
               Do you know what this document
21
     is?
22
         Α
               It's the deed.
23
               And from who to who?
         Q
24
         Α
               It's representing the transfer
25
     of property from Vahak S. Hovnanian and --
```

```
Page 74
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     is it Hasmig Hovnanian a/k/a Paris to the
 3
     VSHPHH Trust.
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 5
               Page -- there's a legal
     description of the property at page 2 of
 6
     Exhibit 15.
 8
               Can you tell which property this
 9
     relates to?
10
               It says at the bottom, "commonly
     known as Village Mall," so I would say
11
12
     it's the Village Mall property.
13
               And so this is a transfer from
         Q
     Vahak and his wife to the VSHPHH Trust?
14
15
               May I see the first page again?
         Α
16
               Of course. Yes.
         Q
17
         Α
               Yes, sir. That is correct.
18
         Q
               Okay.
19
               I have a series of trustee
20
     documents I just want to go through with
21
     you to verify the series of 1041s.
22
               So MM8.
23
                (Whereupon, Form 1041 for 2013
24
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000345 through
25
         USAPROD-000364, was marked as
```

```
Page 75
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
         Defendants' Exhibit 16 for
 3
         identification, as of this date.)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 5
               Do you know if these were
 6
     produced from you or from the system?
     somebody provide them to you in response
     to a summons or subpoena or whatever?
               This looks like it was -- I
 9
         Α
10
     received through -- from the IRS.
11
               Yes, internally, right?
                      This looks like -- there's
12
         Α
               Yes.
13
     a system we have when a return is
     electronically filed, and that looks like
14
15
     the responses we get.
               Based on the bold and the header
16
17
     up here, is that what you're saying? Yes,
18
     right?
19
         Α
               Yes, sir.
20
                      Okay.
                             That reflects a lot
         0
               Yes.
21
     of lost time in my life that I know that.
22
               Okay, and this is from 2013,
23
     1041 for the Pachava Asset Trust,
24
     identifies the fiduciary as Hilde
25
     Hovnanian.
```

```
Page 76
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                Do you recall seeing this
 3
     document?
                Well, you obtained this
 5
     document, so okay.
 6
                I know I asked you, but you
     hadn't spoken -- paid preparer is
 8
     identified as Anthony J. Falcone, CPA.
 9
               You didn't speak to Mr. Falcone
10
     or anybody within his accounting group or
11
     organization, right?
12
         Α
                I don't recall speaking with
13
     Mr. Falcone.
14
         Q
               Okay.
15
                And what about Hilde Hovnanian;
     did you speak to her, anybody within the
16
17
     team speak to her?
18
                In this case, obviously.
                In this case, Hilde Hovnanian
19
         Α
20
     was -- as I recall, was not in the country
21
     any longer.
22
         Q
               Okay.
23
                Did you try and get contact
     information for her or try and reach out
24
25
     for it?
```

```
Page 77
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               I mean it, obviously,
 3
     respectfully, but, you know, e-mail and
     phone and whatever are communications.
 4
 5
               Was there any effort made to
 6
     talk to Hilde Hovnanian at any point, I
     quess?
 8
               Can I speak with counsel for a
 9
     moment?
10
         0
               Of course.
11
               Do you want to go off the
12
     record?
13
         Α
               Yes.
14
                (Discussion held off the record)
15
               MS. COPPLER: I do have to
16
         object under 6103 to the extent you
17
         are asking why he may have contacted
18
         Hilde. But to the extent that you
19
         want to know if he did, he can go
20
         ahead and answer that.
21
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 I'm sorry. You
22
         know what, Cat, can you repeat that?
23
         I just want to make sure I understand.
24
               MS. COPPLER:
                             Yes.
                                    I apologize.
25
               So I object under 6103 to the
```

```
Page 78
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         extent you want to know why he was
 3
         contacting Hilde. But to the extent
 4
         that you just want to know whether he
 5
         did contact Hilde, he can testify as
 6
         to that.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                Yes, okay.
                                             And
 8
         then my foundational components are --
 9
         as I put through is that the
10
         foundational basis for, you know,
11
         hopefully, the appropriateness is that
12
         she's identified as trustee in the
13
         document that they obtained, the tax
14
         return document.
15
               MS. COPPLER:
                              Yes.
16
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: So then it's
17
         like he said, I didn't speak with her.
18
         And I say, well, did you attempt to
19
         speak with her? Done.
20
               MS. COPPLER:
                              Yes.
21
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 So if he
22
         answers that, then that's the end of
23
         that question.
24
               MS. COPPLER: Okay.
                                     Perfect.
25
         Thank you.
```

```
Page 79
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                MR. HANAMIRIAN: Okay.
 3
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                So, Mike, did you attempt to
 4
         Q
 5
     speak to Hilde?
                I attempted to get her contact
 6
     information --
 8
         Q
                Okay.
 9
         Α
                -- from Shant, but I can't say
10
     why.
11
         Q
                Okay. Okay. From Shant.
12
                Did you speak to Shant?
13
                I did on one occasion.
         Α
14
         Q
                In person or on the phone or
15
     in --
16
         Α
                In person.
17
         Q
                Okay.
18
                Let me do this, and then
19
     we'll -- MM9.
20
                (Whereupon, Form 1041 for 2014
21
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000365 through
22
         USAPROD-0003386, was marked as
23
         Defendants' Exhibit 17 for
         identification, as of this date.)
24
25
                Same thing, 1041, Pachava Asset
         Q
```

Page 80 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Trust, except this time, it identifies 3 Peter Hovnanian as the trustee. Do you know who Peter Hovnanian 5 is/was in this process? Other than that he was listed as 6 trustee, I believe he was a relative, but 8 I really don't know that for sure. 9 Q And then same questions, Mike, 10 you know, did you attempt and/or speak to 11 Peter Hovnanian? 12 Α You know, and I can amplify my answer from the last question too. 13 I did send letters to all of the 14 15 people listed as trustees, requesting a 16 copy of the trust agreement. 17 0 Certified mail to --18 I don't recall if they were sent Α 19 certified mail, but they were mailed. What would be the address for 20 21 them; the address of the trust or their individual address? 22 I believe I sent it to the 23 Α individual address that we had on record 24 25 at the service.

```
Page 81
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
                Okay.
 3
                What were the letters
     requesting?
 4
 5
               As I recall, a copy of the trust
 6
     agreements.
         Q
                Okay.
 8
                And then as they say, voila, the
 9
     MM11, a letter from October 12, 2016,
10
     addressed to Peter Hovnanian.
11
                (Whereupon, Letter Bates-stamped
12
         USAPROD-000409, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 18 for
13
         identification, as of this date.)
14
15
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
16
                Is that --
         0
17
         Α
                That is the letter, sir.
18
                There we go. All right, so
         Q
     that's that.
19
20
                And then MM12.
21
                (Whereupon, Letter Bates-stamped
22
         USAPROD-000410, was marked as
23
         Defendants' Exhibit 19 for
         identification, as of this date.)
24
25
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
```

```
Page 82
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               Is that the letter to Hilde?
         0
 3
         Α
               It is.
                (Whereupon, Letters
 5
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000413 through
         USAPROD-000414, was marked as
 6
         Defendants' Exhibit 20 for
         identification, as of this date.)
 8
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 9
               That's a letter to Shant?
10
         0
11
               It is a letter to Shant.
         Α
12
         Q
               Okay.
13
               I don't have any 1041s in the
     production where Shant is identified as
14
15
     the trustee; did you? Did he file?
               MS. COPPLER:
                             Objection.
16
17
               Did he file 1041s? Was he a
         0
     trustee at any point; do you know?
18
19
               I'm sorry to shuffle papers.
20
     I'm trying to get in order.
21
               Was Shant Hovnanian a trustee of
22
     either of two trusts in issue at any point
     in time?
23
24
         Α
               Was there an objection I thought
25
     I heard?
```

```
Page 83
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                             No, not to that
                MS. COPPLER:
 3
         question. You can go ahead and answer
         that question.
 4
 5
                THE WITNESS:
                              Okay.
                I don't recall whether this
 6
     information came from a tax return or
     another document.
 8
                That he would have -- that he
 9
         Q
10
     would be a trustee, right?
11
                Right.
         Α
12
                Because you say, "Obviously, I'm
         Q
     writing to you in your capacity as a
13
     trustee."
14
15
                Yeah, so I -- yeah, I don't
     recall the source of that information.
16
17
         Q
                Okay.
18
                So when you did talk to him, how
19
     did that come about? When you did speak
20
     to Shant Hovnanian, how did that come
21
     about?
22
         Α
                I made a visit.
23
                To?
         Q
                To 520 Navesink River Road.
24
         Α
25
         Q
                Okay.
```

```
Page 84
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               I cannot disclose why I made
 3
     that visit.
         Q
               Okay.
 5
               I knocked on the door and Shant
     Hovnanian answered.
 6
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 I mean, and
         this is more for Cat and/or -- well,
 9
         for Cat.
10
               Why was Mike limited with
11
         respect to a collection visit to a
12
         taxpayer as far as why he would have
13
         gone to the home?
14
               MS. COPPLER: 61 -- Section
15
         6103, I believe, is the concern.
         yes, there's not much more that either
16
17
         Mike or I can say about that.
18
         free to testify about this
         investigation, but that is about all
19
20
         he can testify to.
21
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
22
               So, I mean, we have in -- and,
23
         again, respectfully, in the chief
24
         counsel memorandum, on page 2, which
25
         is numbered 2 at the top, page 2,
```

```
Page 85
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         which is Pl, right, Pl from this.
 3
               Let's pull it up so Mike has --
         actually, I don't have it.
 4
                                      So --
 5
               MS. COPPLER: I'm sorry, but the
 6
         reason is if we explain any further,
 7
         we may be revealing another tax
 8
         liability, so we just have to walk a
 9
         thin line there because, again, we are
10
         concerned with Section 6103.
11
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                No, I
12
         understand. But at the top of page 2,
13
         it says, "With respect to the
14
         deposition on oral exam, unless
15
         indicated as prohibited below, Mike
         may testify as to facts within his
16
17
         personal knowledge concerning," and
18
         then one of the bullet points is the
19
         activities conducted by the IRS to
20
         collect tax liabilities owed by Shant
21
         Hovnanian.
22
               MS. COPPLER:
                              Exactly.
23
                                 It doesn't say
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
         that it's the tax liabilities in this
24
25
                It says the tax liabilities
```

```
Page 86
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         owed by Shant Hovnanian.
 3
               MS. COPPLER:
                             Again --
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Now, that may
         be a draft --
 5
 6
               MS. COPPLER: But with more
         information, it may reveal a tax
 8
         liability that we are not permitted to
 9
         do so today.
10
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
11
               But can he talk about this
12
         liability that's the subject of this
13
         case?
14
               MS. COPPLER: He can.
15
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
16
               All right, so then that's the
17
         question.
18
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
               So then what was -- so let me
19
20
     see what I want to say.
21
               When you interacted with Shant
22
     Hovnanian at the 520 Navesink Road
23
     property, what was the dialogue with
24
     respect to the tax liability in this case?
25
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Is that all
```

```
Page 87
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         right, Cat?
 3
               MS. COPPLER: Yes.
                                    That's
         perfect.
                   Thank you.
 5
         Α
               Very little.
               Well, what did you ask?
 6
         0
               MS. COPPLER: Objection.
                                          Under
 8
         6103, he may only -- again, as long as
         it does not involve another tax
 9
10
         liability, he can talk about the
11
         subject of the conversation.
12
         the extent it falls under 6103, I'm
13
         instructing the witness not to answer.
14
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Understood.
15
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
16
               What did you ask Shant Hovnanian
17
     during that interaction about this tax
18
     liability?
19
               I inquired about his -- where he
20
     lived, about his residence.
21
         Q
               And what did he say, Mike?
22
         Α
               He said that he -- he denied
23
     residing at the 520 Navesink River Road
24
     address, and he indicated that he resided
25
     at the Village Mall address.
```

```
Page 88
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
                Okay.
 3
         Α
                He also told me that his minor
     children resided at 520 Navesink River
 5
     Road.
                Oh, so his children lived at the
 6
         0
     house, but he didn't?
 8
         Α
                That's what he told me.
 9
         Q
                Okay.
10
                And that his other son, Vahak, I
         Α
     believe, resided there as well.
11
12
         Q
                Okay.
13
                I think.
         Α
14
         Q
                Did you say anything in response
15
     to that?
                I recall that -- from the
16
         Α
17
     history refreshing my memory, that I asked
     him -- well, I think I inquired about
18
19
     whether there were living facilities at
20
     Village Mall.
21
                And did he respond?
         Q
22
         Α
                I don't recall his response to
23
            And then I advised him to speak
     that.
24
     with his power of attorney about providing
25
     the financial information to us that we
```

```
Page 89
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     had requested.
 3
         Q
                And for the purposes of the
     liability underlying this case --
 4
 5
         Α
                Yes.
                -- was that the end of the
 6
         0
     dialogue between the two of you?
 8
         Α
                That's all I recall, yeah.
               Okay. Okay.
 9
         Q
10
                Just a few more documents if we
11
     can.
12
                (Whereupon, Documents
13
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000411 through
14
         USAPROD-000412, were marked as
15
         Defendants' Exhibit 21 for
         identification, as of this date.)
16
17
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
18
         Q
               MM13.
19
                Page 1 of MM13; what is this?
20
                      That is a -- the Internal
                Yes.
21
     Revenue Service has a computer system that
     contained --
22
23
               Mike, you know what, let me show
         0
24
     you page 2 before you answer just so that
25
     you have the whole document.
```

```
Page 90
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Α
                Okay.
 3
         Q
                If you were sitting here, you
     would see both, so let me show you 2.
 5
         Α
                Okay.
 6
         Q
                And then you tell me you're
     ready, and I'll go back if you want.
 8
         Α
                Please, go back.
 9
                Okay. Go ahead, then.
         Q
10
         Α
                Okay.
                       The Internal Revenue
     Service has a computer system called IDRS.
11
12
     The IDRS computer system contains various
13
     types of taxpayer data.
14
                Be careful. Just be careful.
         Q
15
     It has to relate only to this notice in
     this case.
16
17
         Α
                Understood, sir, and I
18
     appreciate it.
19
         Q
                Okay.
                I'm just trying to explain to
20
21
     you what this is.
22
         Q
                Okay.
                This is a -- this is a what we
23
         Α
     call an INOLE.
24
25
         Q
                Okay.
```

```
Page 91
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                And this INOLE is -- it's for --
 3
     it provides the Employer Identification
     Number of the VSHPHH Trust and it
 5
     indicates that Shant S. Hovnanian is the
 6
     trustee.
         Q
               Okay.
                I see the INOLE in the left-hand
 8
 9
     corner up there.
10
         Α
                Yes.
11
                Is that one of the famous
12
     government acronyms?
13
                        The set -- if you can
         Α
                It is.
     see there, it shows "filing requirements."
14
15
     That's indicating that there is a 1041
     filing requirement.
16
17
               Now, the page 2 is not really a
18
     page 2. It's a different report. If you
19
     could, pull it up, please.
20
               Yes, I'm trying to.
         0
                                      I'm
21
     clicking and I'm getting --
22
         Α
                It doesn't want to?
23
               Yes, I got it.
         Q
24
         Α
                That's what we call a BMFOLI.
25
         Q
                Okay.
```

Page 92 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 This would reflect any returns 3 filed had any been filed. Q 4 Okay. 5 And so that maybe goes back to 6 my prior question about whether, when as a trustee, he filed returns or not. 8 Α This is likely the source of my 9 understanding, that Shant either was or 10 had been a trustee of that trust. 11 Okay. Okay. 12 And this would be requested for what purpose in this case? 13 In this case, to determine the 14 Α 15 IRS records associated with that trust, such as I explained filing history, EIN 16 17 number, and the information that you see in this exhibit. 18 19 Okay. All right. 20 And then this is the last of the 21 pile of the loose exhibits. 22 MR. HANAMIRIAN: How is everyone 23 doing? Do we need a break? Do we 24 need -- all right? 25 THE WITNESS: I'm good.

```
Page 93
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: We have a
 3
         little ways to go.
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 4
 5
               All right, so then it's MM1.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
                                 Why can't I
 7
         download this file?
                               It says I can't
 8
         download this file. Is it protected?
 9
         It wouldn't be protected in the Box,
10
         right?
11
               All right, so let me go back and
12
         see if the other -- if 2 comes.
13
               Yes, same.
14
               You guys, you know what, just
15
         give us -- can you give us five
         minutes? We just want to see what
16
17
         this technical glitch is on the
18
         downloads.
19
                (Thereupon, a recess was taken,
20
         and then the proceedings continued as
21
         follows:)
22
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
23
               This is MM001, Mr. Kunofsky was
         0
24
     kind enough to provide for you, Mike.
25
                (Whereupon, Notice of Federal
```

```
Page 94
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-000327,
 3
         was marked as Defendants' Exhibit 22
         for identification, as of this date.)
 5
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
         0
               Can you see the document?
         Α
               I can.
               What is this document?
 8
         Q
               This is a Notice of Federal Tax
 9
         Α
     Lien filed --
10
11
         0
               Go ahead.
12
         Α
               -- filed for the 2002 Form 1040,
13
     liability owed by Shant Hovnanian. And it
     was recorded, it looks like -- I think
14
15
     this is Monmouth County, New Jersey.
     hard to read upside-down. But it was
16
17
     recorded it looks like August 4, 2014.
18
         Q
               Okay.
19
               Now, these tax liabilities -- it
20
     says they're 1040 liabilities, which is
21
     individual income tax for periods -- for
22
     the period ended in each instance
23
     12/31/02, but there are three separate
     listed liabilities.
24
25
               Why is that?
```

```
Page 95
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               Like everything else seems to be
 3
     the same except the date of assessment,
     but it's all for the same tax year or tax
 5
     return.
               The date of assessment is the
 6
         Α
     key.
 8
         Q
               Okay.
 9
               So this lien is reflecting that
         Α
10
     there were three assessments made in the
     2002 tax year.
11
12
               And is there any significance to
         0
     the fact that there were -- the
13
14
     assessments are five years apart, or is
15
     that just coincidence?
               It's -- whatever the date is, it
16
17
     is, or was.
18
               As I look at it, I believe the
19
     only two assessment dates that are germane
20
     are the second of the last two.
21
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Stop. Everybody,
22
         stop. I think we just lost John.
23
               John, are you there? Okay.
24
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 I hear you
25
         again. Here we go. I'm sorry.
```

```
Page 96
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               I froze out at the -- I had
 3
         asked Mike if there was any
         significance to the fact that the
 4
 5
         dates of assessment were five years
 6
         apart.
         Α
               No significance to the five
 8
     years.
 9
               What I was saying was, as I look
10
     at the document -- and, again, I know I
     have to stay within this case, but what
11
12
     happens -- how can I explain this?
13
               There are occasions when there
14
     are multiple assessments made within a
15
     given tax year. When that occurs, the
     lien reflects each assessment date.
16
17
         Q
               Okay.
18
         Α
               And that's what's on this lien
19
     here.
20
               Now, are these liens the -- are
         0
21
     the tax liability -- well, let's go
22
     through.
23
               That's 1. All right.
24
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Can we go to
25
         number 2, MM2? Do you have it Ari, or
```

```
Page 97
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
              I can probably try again.
 3
         thing was --
                (Whereupon, Notice of Federal
 5
         Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-000328,
         was marked as Defendants' Exhibit 23
 6
 7
         for identification, as of this date.)
 8
               MR. KUNOFSKY: No. It's fine.
 9
         I got it.
10
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Probably a
11
         factor of --
12
               MR. KUNOFSKY: No, computers are
13
         computers. It's fine.
14
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: There you go.
15
         Okay.
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
16
17
               So MM2.
         Q
18
               This one's much smaller.
         Α
19
         Q
               Yes. Yes.
20
               And these relate to tax period
21
     2004 and 2007, right? And, again, that
22
     multiple assessment, same return that you
     described, right?
23
24
         Α
               Yes, sir.
25
               And then MM1, we did.
                                        MM2.
         Q
```

```
Page 98
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MM3 is --
 3
                (Whereupon, Notice of Federal
         Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-000329,
 4
         was marked as Defendants' Exhibit 24
 5
         for identification, as of this date.)
 6
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Can you guys see
 8
         MM3 right now?
 9
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes.
10
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
11
                So can you see that, Mike?
         0
12
         Α
                That's the federal tax lien for
13
     the 2003 tax period.
14
         Q
               Okay.
15
               And so, now, with respect to
     MM1, 2, and 3, the liability -- the tax
16
17
     liabilities that are identified therein,
     those are the tax liabilities that
18
19
     underlie this case, this claim?
20
         Α
               Yes.
21
         Q
               Okay.
22
                And then there are a series --
23
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: I don't want to
24
         keep bothering you, Ari, but I have no
25
         choice.
```

```
Page 99
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MR. KUNOFSKY: John, if you want
 3
         to give me a sequence of exhibits, I
         can open them all at once, and then if
 4
 5
         you're going through 4, 5, 6, we can
 6
         just go faster that way.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yup.
                                        26, 27,
 8
         and 28.
 9
               MR. KUNOFSKY: And I will get to
10
         26.
              I'm going to zoom out a little.
11
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Good.
                                         Okay.
12
                (Whereupon, Documents
13
         Bates-stamped USAPROD-000340 through
         USAPROD-000341, were marked as
14
15
         Defendants' Exhibit 25 for
         identification, as of this date.)
16
17
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
18
         Q
               This is 26, MM26.
19
               Mike, do you recognize this
20
     document?
21
         Α
               Yes.
22
         0
               What is this document?
               That is the nominee lien
23
         Α
24
     recorded.
                It's captioned "The Shant
25
     Hovnanian Asset Trust as nominee of Shant
```

```
Page 100
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     Hovnanian."
 3
         Q
               Okay.
               And then in MM27, which is the
 5
     next button --
 6
                (Whereupon, Notice of Federal
         Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-001038
 8
         through USAPROD-001039, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 26 for
 9
10
         identification, as of this date.)
11
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
12
         0
               What's this document?
13
               A nominee lien.
               For -- is it a different
14
         Q
15
     document than 26?
                      This one is captioned
16
               Yes.
17
     "Pachava Asset Trust as nominee of Shant
18
     Hovnanian."
19
         Q
               Okay.
                And then 28.
20
21
                (Whereupon, Notice of Federal
22
         Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-001042
23
         through USAPROD-001043, was marked as
         Defendants' Exhibit 27 for
24
25
         identification, as of this date.)
```

```
Page 101
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 3
         Q
               Okay, what's this document,
     Mike?
 4
 5
               Nominee lien captioned "The
     VSH" -- I can't read -- "Trust as nominee
 6
     of Shant Hovnanian."
 8
         Q
               Okay.
 9
               And so --
10
         Α
               VSHPHH Trust.
11
         Q
               Okay.
12
               So questioning as between MM1,
     2, and 3, which are the Notices of Federal
13
     Tax Lien relative to Shant, Shant, Shant,
14
     and then these nominee liens, what is the
15
     difference between the two in this case?
16
17
               MS. COPPLER:
                              Objection. Calls
         for a legal conclusion.
18
19
               But you can answer.
20
               The original liens you showed me
21
     were captioned "Shant Hovnanian,"
     reflecting that he owed the liabilities
22
     reflected on the lien.
23
24
               The nominee liens that you've
25
     shown me reflect the same liabilities, but
```

Page 102

- 1 MACGILLIVRAY
- 2 indicate that these entities are nominees
- 3 of Shant Hovnanian.
- 4 Q And the documents speak for
- 5 themselves, so I'm not testifying. I just
- 6 want to point it out for ease.
- 7 The Shant Hovnanian Notices of
- 8 Federal Tax Lien in the first instance,
- 9 which is MM1, 2, and 3, are each filed in
- 10 2014, 2013, and 2013. So -- and then
- 11 these nominee liens are filed in 2018 in
- 12 each instance.
- 13 What happened between the filing
- 14 of the original Notices of Federal Tax
- 15 Lien and then the Notice of Federal Tax
- 16 Lien with the nominee component?
- 17 A Records were gathered. A report
- 18 was written to the Office of Chief
- 19 Counsel, requesting permission to record
- 20 the nominee liens.
- 21 Q Now, what we have in MM47, a
- 22 transcript, the ICS History Transcript,
- which is MM47.
- MR. HANAMIRIAN: You know what,
- let me just try again because I want

```
Page 103
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         to kind of scroll through that if I
 3
         can.
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Okay.
 5
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Let me see if I
 6
         can get that going somehow.
 7
               I can't do it while you're doing
 8
             Okay. So you're doing it. Okay.
 9
         Let me see if I can pull that up.
10
               MR. KUNOFSKY: I'm going to
11
         close all these tabs, John, and --
12
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes, that's
13
         fine. We're done with that. Thank
14
         you.
15
               MR. KUNOFSKY: Yes. And shut
         down my sharing.
16
17
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes.
                                       Thank
18
               Thank you. Let me see if I can
         you.
19
         get this one open.
20
               THE WITNESS: May I have a quick
21
         bathroom break?
22
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Oh, yes, sure.
         That's fine.
23
               Let's take five minutes for
24
25
         everyone and go off the record if we
```

```
Page 104
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         can.
 3
                (Thereupon, a recess was taken,
         and then the proceedings continued as
 4
 5
         follows:)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
 7
               Mike, I'm pulling up an exhibit,
         0
     which is identified as MM47.
 8
 9
                (Whereupon, ICS History
10
         Transcript Bates-stamped
11
         USAPROD-000001 through USAPROD-000326,
12
         was marked as Defendants' Exhibit 28
13
         for identification, as of this date.)
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
14
15
                Do you recognize this document?
         Q
                Yes.
                      It looks like the ICS
16
         Α
17
     history record.
18
                What does that mean?
         Q
19
               The ICS history -- ICS is a
20
     computer system used by field collection
21
     at IRS to record pertinent events in a --
22
     that occur when we attempt to collect a
     tax liability.
23
24
         Q
               Okay.
25
                And so is this kind of a bit of
```

Page 105 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 a roadmap of your process in this case? 3 Α It would reflect pertinent events that occurred during the case 5 investigation. 6 Q Okay. And -- okay. And going through 8 here, I mean, it's a lot of pages. 9 literally hundreds of pages. But the --10 let's go through a few of them. We'll go down to -- I'll scroll down to -- we're 11 12 still in Exhibit 47 and we'll be there. 13 So each reference to a page is still 14 within -- it's going to be within 47. 15 So page 2, page 3, we have a -there's a line item here. 16 17 Can you see this, Mike? Can you see it clearly? 18 19 Α It's a little small, but I can. 20 I think I can manage. 21 It says "Shant" -- there's -- at Q 22 paragraph 2, and then there's the sixth 23 paragraph, if you can call them that, it 24 starts out and says, "Shant Hovnanian's 25 ex-wife is Nina Tower."

```
Page 106
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                Who is Nina Tower; do you know?
 3
         Α
                ICS history indicates that it is
     Shant Hovnanian's ex-wife. I believe her
     to be his first wife.
 5
 6
         Q
                Okay.
                Was she involved in this case at
     all at any level for this tax liability in
     this case?
 9
10
               Not to my recollection.
         Α
11
                Go ahead.
         Q
12
         Α
                No.
13
                Did you speak to her in the
         Q
     context of this case?
14
15
                I don't recall speaking with
         Α
16
     her.
17
         Q
                Okay.
18
                Any communication?
19
         Α
                Not that I recall.
20
         Q
                Okay.
21
                Moving down to -- and these
22
     portions that are identified as
23
     attorney-client are redacted for just that
24
     reason, correct?
25
                MS. COPPLER: Objection.
```

```
Page 107
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Attorney-client privilege.
 3
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes, okay.
 4
         Okay.
 5
               I just want to make sure that
 6
         this is okay because we received the
 7
         following response from Laurie Nasky
         in the Office of Chief Counsel.
 8
 9
               Is that okay to be in there, or
10
         should that have been redacted as
11
         well; do you know?
12
               MS. COPPLER:
                             If it wasn't
13
         redacted, we can -- I mean, we can
         discuss it. I mean, I don't think we
14
15
         should probably get into the propriety
         of prior redactions unless, you know,
16
17
         you want to ask about them.
18
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes, I mean,
19
         Cat, in my defense world, the identity
20
         of counsel, the existence of counsel
21
         in and of itself can be privileged,
22
         and so what I don't want because I
23
         obviously am concerned about the
24
         purity of the process for a number of
25
         reasons, I don't want evidence
```

```
Page 108
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         anywhere in the process that's
 3
         problematic, right?
               MS. COPPLER: Okay. And I
 5
         appreciate that. Thank you for your
 6
         concern.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Yes, okay.
 8
               And then you can politely tell
 9
         me that we can take care of ourselves
10
         and --
11
               MS. COPPLER:
                              Thank you.
12
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                All right.
13
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
14
         Q
               On page 5 at the bottom, there's
15
     an action date entry from July 8, 2013.
     And, rest assured, I'm not going to do
16
17
     this with each action date so you can
     keep -- we can keep the remains of our
18
19
     hair.
20
               But it says that you were
21
     advised to -- "Counsel advised RO to
22
     contact Coleman Renty, the IRS employee
23
     who handled the TEFRA closing in this
     matter."
24
25
               Are you allowed to speak about
```

Page 109 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 any contact or communication with Coleman 3 Renty? I ask again because it refers to 5 counsel having suggested the contact. MS. COPPLER: 6 To the extent that he spoke with him in investigating the tax liabilities that are at issue in 8 9 this lawsuit, yes, he can speak to --10 he can testify about that. 11 MR. HANAMIRIAN: Okay. 12 BY MR. HANAMIRIAN: 13 Mike? Q 14 Α Yes, sir. 15 What do you think? Q If you recall when -- earlier, 16 17 when we first started, when you asked what 18 we first did, and I indicated that there 19 was a litigation hold on one of the 20 periods. 21 Q Yes. 22 Α That is what this is referring 23 The -- do you see where it says "Status 72"? 24 25 Q Yes.

Page 110 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Internally, that means there was Α 3 a litigation hold. And I was contacting this gentleman to see if it was -- it 4 5 should be reversed and the case -- then the period assigned to me. Q Okay. And the acronym TURFRA; is that a mistake? Should it be TEFRA? 9 10 Yes. That should be TEFRA. 11 And so that's somebody from --12 looking at tax laws. 13 So Coleman Renty is somebody 14 within partnerships or limited 15 partnerships within the service, yes? 16 Yeah, I really don't know. Α 17 Q Okay. I was just advised he was the 18 Α 19 guy to -- at that point, he was the guy to 20 talk to. 21 And did you? Q This communication that's 22 Α 23 recorded in the history was my contact 24 with him, as I recall. 25 Okay. Okay. Q

```
Page 111
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               And then as we keep scrolling
 3
     through, we'll go down further, page 10.
               The page 9 here, these
 4
 5
     communications between you and Read
     Rankin, William Read Rankin, is
 6
     identified.
 8
               Was Mr. Rankin cooperative with
 9
     you in this context? And I say that --
10
     let me frame that a little bit.
11
               You know, we have an obligation
12
     as counsel in the context of dialogue with
     the Internal Revenue Service under various
13
     obligations, Circular 230 and whatever
14
15
     else, you know, for truthfulness and
     veracity and cooperation and whatever
16
17
     else.
18
               Was Mr. Rankin appropriate in
19
     his dialogue with you in your experience?
20
     And particularly in the context of this
21
     case, was his responsiveness appropriate?
22
         Α
               I'll say this --
23
               MS. COPPLER: Objection.
                                           Ι
24
         think that calls for a legal
25
         conclusion.
```

```
Page 112
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
               But you can go ahead and answer.
 3
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: He can answer?
 4
         Okay. Thank you.
 5
               I was going to say Mr. Rankin
 6
     was -- as I recall, he was polite.
     indicated in this contact, as I recall,
 8
     that, yes, he still -- he wanted to -- he
 9
     needed to contact his client to ascertain
10
     if he will represent him in the collection
11
     matter, but he also indicated that he may
12
     advise his client not to provide the
13
     information that we would request for
     financial information.
14
15
         Q
               Okay.
               Well, what did you think of
16
17
     that?
               I -- it was somewhat unusual,
18
         Α
19
     but not unprecedented.
20
         0
               Okay. Okay.
21
               And only with respect to the
22
     financial information, right? I mean, he
23
     didn't -- did he say that he would advise
24
     his client not to communicate at all?
25
         Α
                    He -- limiting my response
               No.
```

Page 113 MACGILLIVRAY 1 2 to what's recorded here, he needed to 3 contact his client to see if he would represent him, but he also advised that he 4 5 may advise his client not to provide information to the service. 6 Q Okay. 8 And, I mean -- and you're a 9 little bit -- in this context, you're a 10 little bit hamstrung, right, because until 11 he says he's the power, he really can't 12 have a conversation about the taxpayer; it 13 has to be pretty broad brush, right? 14 Α Well, he had a power of attorney active on the system. 15 16 0 Yes. 17 Α So from our perspective, he was 18 the power of attorney. But he provided that information to me, so I felt it was 19 20 appropriate to give him a deadline to give 21 him a little time to speak with his client 22 and get back to me. 23 Q Okay. 24 And then he is -- on page 10, on 25 the Friday, March 30, 2018, 12:52 p.m.

Page 114

- 1 MACGILLIVRAY
- 2 entry that's continued on, is this
- 3 communication, where it starts with "We
- 4 briefly discussed the OIC provisions in
- 5 view of the large of the large balance
- 6 due," is this part of the same
- 7 conversation?
- 8 A It is, yes.
- 9 Q And so at that point, Mr. Rankin
- 10 provided you with information the taxpayer
- 11 was CEO of a company named Speedus and
- 12 straight on down the line through the rest
- 13 of your narrative?
- 14 A Yes. He was providing me with
- 15 the background of how we got here.
- 16 Q When he says "the taxpayer's
- 17 attorney was named Valdez," which is about
- 18 three quarters of the way down the page,
- 19 and that Valdez left the country over the
- 20 issue, was that -- did you understand that
- 21 to mean the issue underlying, the tax
- 22 liability in issue in this case?
- 23 A My understanding was that -- and
- 24 this was Mr. Rankin providing me with this
- 25 information.

```
Page 115
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               Understood.
         0
 3
         Α
               My understanding was that
     Mr. Valdez had given Mr. Hovnanian some
 4
 5
     advice and it turned out to be -- it
     resulted in this audit. And that's my
 6
     understanding.
 8
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
 9
               Then he's talking about Speedus
10
     had litigation with WIC Corporation that
11
     resulted in a $2.8 million settlement.
12
               Do you know who WIC Corporation
     is now, or at that time did you know?
13
14
         Α
               I don't believe so, no.
15
               Did you ever look into that
         0
     statement?
16
17
         Α
               Not that I recall.
18
         Q
               Okay.
19
               On page 22 of this Exhibit 47
20
     still -- it's going to take some -- if you
21
     want to turn away for a second, some
22
     scrolling will make you dizzy.
23
               It's easier to go down the left
24
     side, isn't it?
25
                               Hey, Mike, put
               MR. KUNOFSKY:
```

Page 116 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 your mouse at the bottom of the screen 3 for a second. MR. HANAMIRIAN: Got it. Got 5 Got it. Thank you, though. BY MR. HANAMIRIAN: 6 Q Page 22. All right. So there are series of entities 8 here and some information. 9 10 Can you tell me about the information on this page and what it 11 12 represents? This is research done on various 13 Α 14 entities associated with Mr. Hovnanian, 15 business entities. 16 Q Okay. 17 And then the VS Hovnanian Group; that's the first time we're seeing that 18 19 one. 20 Do you know what that entity was 21 or is or --22 Α Other than that it was a business associated with Mr. Hovnanian --23 Were a lot of interrelated 24 Q 25 entities that -- you described that

Page 117 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 earlier. 3 There were a lot of these common ownership or interrelated -- otherwise 4 interrelated entities in this case? 5 There were several. 6 Α Yes. You identify here as the owners Q 8 of the VS Hovnanian Group, Inc. -- you 9 identify Nina Hovnanian as potentially 10 ex-wife because, obviously, that's before you knew it was -- I guess you're 11 12 referring to Shant and identifying in the 13 parentheticals who's who. He's the TP. 14 Is that before, obviously, you 15 knew that's his sister, Nina? Can you go back to that? 16 Α 17 Q Yes, sure. 18 The paragraph where it says, 19 "The owners were: Vahak, Paris, Shant, Nina." 20 21 Α As I sit here, I don't know if 22 that Nina is his ex-wife or his sister. don't recall because I -- there's no other 23 24 information there, so I can't say. 25 If you're -- are you telling me

```
Page 118
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     it's his sister?
 3
         Q
                Yes, yes, yes.
         Α
               Okay.
 5
                That's all right.
         Q
                                    I mean, I'm
 6
     not -- yes.
         Α
                Yes.
 8
         Q
                I'm just curious on that one.
 9
                If we go to page 28, towards the
10
     bottom, the action date of 11/26/13, the
11
     systemic history, forms/correspondence,
12
     beginning Notice of Levy. 668A requested
     for -- what's 668A?
13
14
         Α
               That's a Notice of Levy.
15
                Just Notice of Levy? That's not
         Q
     the nominee levy stuff that we were
16
17
     talking about before, is it?
18
         Α
               No.
19
         Q
               Okay.
20
                Those are just regular levies.
         Α
21
         Q
               Okay.
22
                On page 58, it looks like you're
23
     identifying -- or you're talking about
24
     some of the trusts and some sequencing
25
     here.
```

```
Page 119
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
                Can you tell me what's happening
 3
     here?
 4
         Α
                Can you go -- can I see the
 5
     previous page?
 6
         Q
                Of course.
                Do you want me to go up further?
 8
         Α
                Yeah, go up further.
 9
         Q
                Okay.
10
                Because that's a very long
         Α
                I did not write that history.
11
     history.
12
         Q
                Okay. Go ahead.
13
                You can see "create ID," and
     there's a number.
14
15
         Q
                Yes.
                The history entries by me was
16
         Α
17
     number 3529. As I recall, that history
     was written by the Mr. Rutledge that I
18
19
     spoke of earlier.
20
         0
                Okay.
21
         Α
                I just wanted to make that
22
     clear.
23
         Q
                No, no, I appreciate it.
                But the information that's
24
25
     reflected on the document, are you
```

Page 120 MACGILLIVRAY 1 2 familiar with the information from this 3 case? Α I believe so. If you show me 5 which page you'd like me to --Well, I'll go to 57, which is 6 what's up there now. 8 Α Okay. 9 And that document reflects what 0 10 to you? 11 It is just basic research of --Α 12 It seems to be consistent with 0 13 some of the document analysis we did earlier. 14 15 Yeah, it is. It's research on -- there's some documentation of 16 17 business entities, and then it segues into some basic real property information. 18 19 Q Okay. 20 Now -- and then the next page, I 21 think more of the same. This is where we 22 started out with the trusts and --23 Α Okay. 24 These other trusts -- there's Q 25 the Shant Hovnanian Asset Trust, which

Page 121 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 we're familiar with in this case; the 3 Pachava Asset Trust, which we're familiar And then we have three, four, and with. 5 five here: The Vahak Hovnanian Asset Trust, Paris Hovnanian Asset Trust, and 6 the Charentz Hovnanian Asset Trust. 8 Are you familiar with any of 9 those, those latter three documents, 10 three, four, five? 11 Α I'm not. 12 Did any of that documentation 0 13 come into play in the context of asserting 14 the nominee lien from the trust that you 15 did? 16 I don't believe so. Α 17 Q Okay. 18 Is there -- you know, as I said, 19 your history transcript goes -- is 20 obviously quite extensive. That's the 21 first 200 pages. 22 Is there -- I'm going through 23 and it's -- and, again, it's very 24 repetitive of what you identified in the 25 course of the document, so I don't want to

Page 122 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 go through each page, not because I don't 3 want to, but because I don't think it's 4 necessary. But I actually need you to 5 tell me that. 6 So is there anything that came into your decision-making process that's 8 not protected by an attorney-client or 9 other confidentiality obligation that we 10 haven't spoken about today? 11 So were there other factors in 12 determining to attempt to impose a nominee 13 lien on the trusts the subject of this 14 litigation that we haven't spoken about or 15 that doesn't exist in the documents that 16 we have? 17 MS. COPPLER: I'm going to 18 object to that. I think it could 19 potentially get into attorney-client, 20 as you mentioned, and also work 21 product. But Mr. MacGillivray is free 22 to testify about anything that he discovered in the course of his 23 24 investigation. 25 MR. HANAMIRIAN: Yes. And T

```
Page 123
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         apologize for the fractured question.
 3
         I'm just trying to determine that I
         understand the entirety of the
 5
         basis -- the factual basis, not the
         legal analysis, but the factual
 6
 7
         basis -- underlying the nominee lien.
               MS. COPPLER: Yes, of course.
 8
 9
         Absolutely.
10
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: And that's all
11
         I'm trying to --
12
               MS. COPPLER: Thank you for
13
         clarifying.
14
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: That's all I'm
15
         trying to get, is that do we have all
         the facts that you had? How's that?
16
17
               Is that okay, Cat?
18
               MS. COPPLER: Yes. Go ahead.
19
         He can answer that.
20
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay.
21
         Α
               I believe we've covered most of
22
     the pertinent facts. We've been here for
23
     a couple hours, so I can't really recall
24
     everything we discussed, but I think we're
25
     in the ballpark.
```

```
Page 124
 1
                   MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay.
 3
               There's nothing in your head
     where you would say, oh, Hanamirian didn't
 4
 5
     catch that?
 6
         Α
               Nothing comes to mind, sir.
         Q
               Okay. Thank you. All right.
 8
               Ms. Gandolfo, she had a
 9
     deposition, you may or may not know, a
10
     week or so ago, and she complained about
11
     you.
12
               Now, meeting you, it's kind of
13
     hard to believe, but we have to believe
14
     because she's under oath. But she said
15
     that you had visited the business premises
     and that she -- and these are her words,
16
17
     but that, you know, she -- and it's a
18
     paraphrase of her words -- but that she
19
     found you imposing.
20
               Would you disagree with that
21
     characterization at any level of you?
22
         Α
               While I can't speak to her
23
     perception, at no time was I attempting to
24
     be imposing.
25
               What were your interactions with
         Q
```

Page 125 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Karen Gandolfo -- wait -- obviously, with 3 respect to the liabilities with Shant Hovnanian that underlie this litigation? 4 5 After this litigation was filed, 6 DOJ Attorney Ari Kunofsky asked me to attempt to serve the notice and complaint 8 on Shant Hovnanian. My interactions with 9 Karen Gandolfo occurred in my attempts to 10 do so. 11 0 Okay. Okay. 12 So what happened? In your 13 attempt to serve the notice and complaint, 14 what happened? What did you do? Did 15 you --16 Α I attempted to serve the notice 17 and complaint, as I recall, at two 18 locations: the house at 520 Navesink River 19 Road and the Village Mall address in 20 Howell. 21 Q And this was service of process 22 on Shant or on the trusts? 23 Α On -- as I recall, on Shant. 24 Q Okay. 25 There may have been -- as I Α

```
Page 126
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     recall, on Shant.
 3
         Q
                Okay.
                And so then what happened?
 5
     did you do? Can you take me through it?
 6
                There were several attempts.
     I'm not sure I understand --
 8
         Q
                Well, you drove to somewhere,
 9
     right? You went somewhere to serve
10
     the notice and the complaint for Shant?
11
         Α
                Yeah. I went to 520, the house
12
     at 520.
13
         Q
                Okay.
14
                And then what --
15
                Well, on several attempts.
         Α
16
         Q
                Okay.
17
         Α
                There was times that no one was
18
     there.
19
         Q
                Okay.
20
                And then, ultimately, was
21
     anybody there to accept service?
22
         Α
                There were two occasions I
     recall where Karen Gandolfo was at the 520
23
     address.
24
25
                At the house?
         Q
```

```
Page 127
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               At the house.
         Α
 3
         Q
               Okay.
               On one occasion, I knocked on
         Α
 5
     the door. She wouldn't open it.
     another occasion --
 6
               Did she say anything to you,
         Q
     Mike?
 8
 9
               I really don't recall the
         Α
     substance of what she said.
10
               Okay.
11
         0
12
               When you knock on the door, do
     you identify yourself? Were you alone?
13
14
         Α
               I believe Rebecca Troichuk was
15
     with me.
16
         Q
               Okay.
17
               So you knock on the door and you
     say, IRS, whatever, blah, blah, or
18
         Was that too --
19
     no?
20
               I don't recall exactly what was
21
            I was attempting to serve the
22
     summons and complaint.
23
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
24
               And then what was the second
25
     attempt?
```

Page 128 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 There was another occasion at Α 3 that address, where I had gone there in the morning and Karen Gandolfo drove up 4 5 and she went in the house. 6 Q Okay. And then what? She was in the 8 house, and then you went back up to the door or --9 10 I don't recall if I did. Α 11 Q Okay. 12 I may have knocked on the door. Α I really don't recall. I may have left 13 the summons attached to the door --14 15 Q Okay. -- on both occasions, but I 16 17 don't recall. Now, this is the summons in the 18 Q 19 litigation or a summons-summons? 20 No. The summons and complaint 21 in this litigation. 22 Q Okay. 23 And did you also go and try and 24 serve process on Shant Hovnanian at any 25 other -- or this is such terrible

Page 129 MACGILLIVRAY 1 2 grammatical -- at any other location? 3 At the Village Mall address; 4 yes, sir. 5 And what happened there? I knocked on the door. 6 Α There was no answer. I went into -- I was with 8 Rebecca Troichuk again. I went into the 9 accounting office, and they gave me access 10 to the common area of the building through 11 their door. I went up -- we went 12 There was an open office door, upstairs. 13 where we found Karen Gandolfo inside at a 14 desk. 15 So you went through the tenant's 0 office, the tenant accounting firm? 16 17 Α Yes, sir. 18 Q Okay. 19 And then she said -- Karen said 20 that she was on the second floor; is that 21 right? 22 Α Yeah. The accountant's office 23 lets you into like this common area. 24 Q Okay. 25 And then there's unobstructed --Α

Page 130 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 there's steps, went up to the second 3 floor, and there was an open door, we went inside, and Karen Gandolfo was in an office. 5 6 0 Did you announce yourselves as you were going in, inside that second --8 that open door? 9 Α I believe when we -- when we 10 came upon her, I believe I identified myself and handed her -- I believe I 11 12 handed her the summons and complaint. 13 She said she was startled. Q 14 Is that consistent with what you 15 remember? I don't recall that, but I can't 16 17 testify to her internal feelings. 18 Q No, I know. 19 But, you know, somebody can look 20 startled when you see them, right? 21 Α That's not my recollection, but 22 I --Okay. 23 Q 24 Α I can't speak to it. 25 And so what happened? Q Did you

```
Page 131
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
     give her the summons and complaint or --
 3
               I believe I did.
               Did you think that that was
         Q
 5
     effective service of process?
 6
               MS. COPPLER: Objection.
                                          Calls
         for a legal --
 8
               At this point, I can ask that
 9
     because you're process serving. It's not
10
     a legal issue.
11
               Did you think that you were
12
     fulfilling your task by giving it to
13
     Karen?
14
         Α
               I'm not sure.
15
         Q
               Okay.
               Did you try and serve Shant
16
17
     again anywhere else after that?
18
               Well, I want to say that I did
         Α
19
     ask Karen for Shant's whereabouts to help
20
     aid in serving Shant.
21
               Did she respond?
         Q
22
               As I recall, she did not provide
     that information.
23
24
         Q
               Okay.
25
               And so did you, then, try
```

```
Page 132
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     anywhere else to serve Shant?
 3
         Α
               I don't recall the -- you know,
     the -- which came first, if that makes
 5
     sense.
 6
         Q
               Okay.
               But I made several attempts to
         Α
     serve Shant at the 520 address.
 9
         Q
               Okay.
10
               I mean -- and with respect to
     the open door, Karen said that the public
11
12
     access area was locked or whatever, just
     as you describe, and that she's then on a
13
     second -- in a second floor unit with -- I
14
15
     quess without public access from her
     office; is that correct?
16
17
         Α
               I was granted access by the
18
     tenant.
19
         Q
               Okay.
20
               Did you believe that the tenant
21
     had the authority to do that?
22
               MS. COPPLER: Objection.
                                          Calls
23
         for a legal conclusion.
24
               You can answer.
25
               Did you believe that that was
         Q
```

```
Page 133
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     appropriate as a process server?
 3
         Α
                I did.
         Q
               Okay.
 5
                Why?
 6
         Α
                Because the tenant had access,
 7
     so I believed that their granting me
 8
     access was proper.
 9
         Q
               Okay.
10
                Your internal procedures as they
     apply to this case, when entering a
11
12
     taxpayer's premises, would you have gone
     through the tenant's premises for the
13
14
     purpose of confronting the taxpayer?
15
         Α
                I'm not sure.
16
         Q
               Okay. Okay.
17
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Ari and Cat,
18
         just can you give me a couple minutes?
19
         I want to go -- I'll just go on mute
20
         for a couple minutes, and then see if
21
         there's anything else. But,
22
         otherwise, we're probably close to
23
         done, all right?
24
               MS. COPPLER:
                              Okay.
                                      Thank you.
25
                (Pause in proceedings.)
```

Page 134 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 BY MR. HANAMIRIAN: 3 Q I mean, just as a little bit of a follow-up on the interaction with this 4 5 Karen Gandolfo because she was just so --6 she was pretty compelling about her interaction with you and with the other 8 agent. Did she -- she said that the 9 10 other revenue officer did not identify 11 herself. 12 Do you recall the other agent identifying herself in this process? 13 14 Α I do not recall. 15 I can't -- I can't ask you blanket procedural questions. 16 17 MR. HANAMIRIAN: But see if this works, Cat. 18 19 Was it common for you to serve a 20 summons and complaint in any case in which 21 you were involved in? 22 MR. HANAMIRIAN: Is that okay, 23 Cat? 24 MR. KUNOFSKY: I think we can 25 actually -- for what it's worth,

```
Page 135
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
         that's a decision that the trial
 3
         attorney for a DOJ case just makes.
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Okay. Okay.
 5
         All right.
     BY MR. HANAMIRIAN:
 6
         Q
               Have you ever served a summons
 8
     and complaint in any other case in which
 9
     you've been involved in, Mike?
10
         Α
               Yes.
11
         Q
               Okay.
12
                How long have you been with the
     service?
13
         Α
14
                30 years.
15
                What's your background?
         Q
                                          Where
     did you start and where did you -- I know
16
17
     where you are, but where did you start?
                I came on in 1991 --
18
         Α
19
         Q
               Okay.
20
                -- as a revenue officer in Mays
         Α
21
     Landing, New Jersey.
22
                Okay. Oh, so you came right in
     as a revenue officer.
23
24
                What's your background?
25
                I was a -- I graduated from
         Α
```

```
Page 136
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
     Rutgers.
 3
         Q
                Okay.
                I substitute taught for a little
         Α
     while and then became a revenue officer.
 5
 6
         Q
                Okay.
                What's your education
 8
     background? Accounting or --
 9
         Α
                I have a bachelor's degree in
10
     sociology.
11
         Q
                Oh, okay. Okay.
12
                And so then you're just straight
13
     through with the service since that time?
14
         Α
                Yes, sir.
15
                And in the same role, as an RO?
         Q
16
         Α
                No.
17
         Q
                Okay.
                I was a revenue officer until
18
         Α
     the late '90s, I believe.
19
20
         Q
                Okay.
21
         Α
                I became a cadre manager at the
22
     time.
23
                Where was that?
         Q
24
         Α
                That -- the cadre manager, they
25
     had you -- I was working in the old Ocean
```

Page 137 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 POD at the time, which is now Freehold, 3 and they would send you to different groups that needed a manager. 4 5 Q Oh, okay. 6 Α Then I finally became a manager in Cherry Hill. I stepped down for 8 personal reasons. The job wasn't a good fit for me. 9 10 In, I'm going to say, 2001, I came back to be a revenue officer again. 11 I was a revenue officer from then until 12 13 And I'm currently a program 14 analyst. 15 0 What's that mean, program 16 analyst? 17 Α We update the Internal Revenue manuals, provide guidance to the field. 18 19 Q Okay. 20 Α Things of that nature. 21 Okay. Okay. MR. HANAMIRIAN: 22 Good. 23 All right, thank you for your 24 time, Mike. 25 Thank you, sir. THE WITNESS:

```
Page 138
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                Ari or Cat?
 3
               MS. COPPLER: Yes, we are going
 4
         to have a few questions, but would you
 5
         mind giving us about like 10 minutes
 6
         or so just to get them ready, if
 7
         that's all right with you?
 8
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                 Sure.
 9
               MS. COPPLER: Thank you so much.
10
               Can we go off the record, then?
11
               MR. HANAMIRIAN:
                                Yes, sure.
12
                (Discussion held off the record)
13
     EXAMINATION BY
     MS. COPPLER:
14
15
               Mr. MacGillivray, do you
     understand that you're still under oath?
16
17
         Α
               Yes.
               Perfect. Thank you.
18
         Q
                                     I just
19
     have a few follow-up questions.
20
     isn't going to take long at all.
21
               So, first of all, you mentioned
22
     earlier on today that there were other
23
     revenue officers who were helping you out
     at this case.
24
25
               Were they more so helpers?
```

Page 139 1 MACGILLIVRAY 2 Α I would say yes. 3 Q So they were just assisting you in your investigation? 4 5 They were lower-graded 6 revenue officers assigned by the supervisor to assist me. 8 Q Thank you. 9 And when you first met Shant in 10 person at the 520 Navesink property, did 11 he say that Hilde was his ex-wife? 12 Α He did. 13 Did Shant say that Hilde was no Q longer living in the United States? 14 15 Α He did. You also previously mentioned 16 17 that you sent out numerous postal tracers. 18 Did you request any postal 19 tracers after the litigation began? 20 I believe that when I was unable 21 to serve Shant with the summons and 22 complaint that a follow-up postal tracer 23 was processed. 24 And then you also testified Q 25 earlier that there were multiple entities

```
Page 140
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
     owned by Shant, right?
 3
         Α
               Yes.
         Q
               Okay.
 5
               And when you said that they were
 6
     owned, do you mean like legal ownership or
     do you mean that Shant controlled these
     entities?
 8
 9
         Α
               Shant controlled these entities.
10
         Q
               Okay.
11
               And kind of along the same
12
     lines, you mentioned that many of the
13
     entities may have been sharing the same
14
     address at the Village Mall. And you had
     testified there was nothing significant in
15
     and of itself that they were sharing the
16
17
     address.
18
               But may it have indicated that
19
     those entities were controlled by one
20
     person or similar people?
21
         Α
               Yes.
22
         0
               I'm sorry. We're kind of
23
     skipping around here, but there's only a
24
     few questions.
25
               Next thing you had talked about,
```

```
Page 141
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 1
 2
     you know, the significance of the deeds
 3
     for all the properties.
               And if you just recall, for
 5
     example, the 520 Navesink property deed,
 6
     did it seem to indicate that the property
     was being transferred between family
     members?
 8
 9
         Α
               Yes.
10
                And did that deed, for example,
         0
     show a small dollar amount of
11
12
     consideration?
13
         Α
               A dollar, yes.
14
         Q
               Okay.
15
                What about for the Village Mall;
     do you recall that deed?
16
17
         Α
                Yes.
                      It was a similar
18
     situation.
19
         0
                Perfect.
                          Thank you.
20
                Did any of the Pachava trustees
21
     or Shant's power of attorney or whoever
22
     you contacted ever provide you with a copy
     of the Shant Hovnanian Asset Trust trust
23
24
     agreement?
25
               Not that I recall.
         Α
```

```
Page 142
 1
                    MACGILLIVRAY
 2
         Q
               Okay.
 3
               So you would have no way of
 4
     knowing if the Shant Hovnanian Asset Trust
 5
     had sub-trusts for each kid, would you?
 6
         Α
               No.
               MS. COPPLER: Okay. That's all
 8
         I have. Thank you.
 9
               MR. HANAMIRIAN: I have no
10
         follow-up. I'm fine.
                                 Thanks.
11
               MR. KUNOFSKY: We'll want to
12
         order a copy of the transcript.
13
                (Time noted: 2:58 p.m. EST)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
                            MICHAEL MacGILLIVRAY
21
     Subscribed and sworn to
22
23
     before me this
                          day
24
     of
                      , 2020.
25
```

				Page	143
	I N D E X				
WITNESS	EXAMINATION B	Y PA	AGE		
MICHAEL MACG	ILLIVRAY				
	MR. HANAMIRIA	N	5		
	MS. COPPLER	-	138		
	EXHIBITS				
PLAINTIFF'S		FOR	TD		
PLAINIIFF 5		FOR	ID.		
Exhibit 1			5		
	ief Counsel Inter ice Memorandum	nal			
	EXHIBITS				
	EXIIIDIIS				
DEFENDANTS'		FOR	ID.		
Exhibit 1			16		
PNC Bank Reco	ords		10		
Bates-stamped USAPROD-0005	d USAPROD-000458 10	through			
Exhibit 2			19		
Postal Trace: Bates-stamped	r d USAPROD-000536				
Exhibit 3			23		
Various Docum		1.1 1.			
USAPROD-0005	d USAPROD-000537	tnrougn			
	-				
Exhibit 4	O		31		
Response to S Bates-stamped	Summons d USAPROD-000785	through			
USAPROD-0008		0112 0 0 911			
D1-11-14 F			37		
Exhibit 5	~				
Response to		4-1			
Response to	d USAPROD-000544	through			

,				Page	144
1	EXHIBITS				
2	DEFENDANTS'	FOR	ID.		
3	Exhibit 6 Summons		47		
4	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000890 USAPROD-000937	through			
5	Exhibit 7		52		
6	Response to Summons Bates-stamped USAPROD-000567	through			
7	USAPROD-000649				
8	Exhibit 8 Affinity Federal Credit Union	Records	54		
9	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000858 USAPROD-000889				
10	Exhibit 9		60		
11	Various Documents Bates-stamped USAPROD-000775	through	00		
12	USAPROD-000784	0 0 0.9			
13	Exhibit 10 Response to Subpoena		63		
14	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000938 USAPROD-000997	through			
15	Exhibit 11		64		
16	Response to Subpoena Bates-stamped USAPROD-000650	through	04		
17	USAPROD-000687	_			
18	Exhibit 12 Deed		67		
19	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000300 USAPROD-000334	through			
20	Exhibit 13		69		
21	Corrective Deed Bates-stamped USAPROD-000335	through			
22	USAPROD-000339				
23	Exhibit 14 Trust Agreement Amendment		71		
24	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000342 USAPROD-000344	through			
25					

			Pa	ge	145
1					
2	EXHIBITS				
3	DEFENDANTS'	FOR	ID.		
4	Exhibit 15 Deed		73		
5	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000415 USAPROD-000418	through			
6	12 14 14 16				
7	Exhibit 16 Form 1041 for 2013		74		
8	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000345 USAPROD-000364	through			
9	Exhibit 17 Form 1041 for 2014		79		
10	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000365 USAPROD-0003386	through			
11	Exhibit 18		81		
12	Letter Bates-stamped USAPROD-000409		01		
13	Exhibit 19		81		
14	Letter		01		
15	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000410				
13	Exhibit 20		82		
16	Letters				
17	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000413 USAPROD-000414	through			
18	Exhibit 21 Documents		89		
19	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000411 USAPROD-000412	through			
20	Exhibit 22		93		
21	Notice of Federal Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-000327				
22	Exhibit 23		97		
23	Notice of Federal Tax Lien				
24	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000328				
25					
-					

,			Page	146
1				
2	EXHIBITS			
3	DEFENDANTS'	FOR ID.		
4 5	Exhibit 24 Notice of Federal Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-000329	98		
6	Exhibit 25	99		
7	Documents Bates-stamped USAPROD-000340 USAPROD-000341	through		
8	Exhibit 26	100		
9	Notice of Federal Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-001038 USAPROD-001039	through		
11	Exhibit 27	100		
12	Notice of Federal Tax Lien Bates-stamped USAPROD-001042 USAPROD-001043			
13		104		
14	Exhibit 28 ICS History Transcript	104		
15	Bates-stamped USAPROD-000001 USAPROD-000326	through		
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

```
Page 147
 1
 2
               CERTIFICATE
 3
     STATE OF NEW YORK )
 4
                           SS
                        •
 5
     COUNTY OF NEW YORK)
 6
                 I, Stephanie M. Butler, a Notary
     Public within and for the State of New York,
 8
 9
     do hereby certify:
10
               That MICHAEL MACGILLIVRAY, the
11
     witness whose deposition is hereinbefore set
12
     forth, was duly sworn by me and that such
13
     deposition is a true record of the testimony
     given by the witness.
14
15
               I further certify that I am
     not related to any of the parties to this
16
17
     action by blood or marriage, and that I am
18
     in no way interested in the outcome of this
19
     matter.
20
               IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
21
     hereunto set my hand this 15th day of
22
     February, 2021.
23
24
                           STEPHANIE M. BUTLER
25
```

		Page	148
1			
2	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET		
3	Our Assignment No: SY001289		
4	Case Caption:		
5	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA		
6	vs.		
7	SHANT HOVNANIAN, et al.		
8	DECLARATION UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY		
9	I declare under penalty of perjury		
10			
11	that I have read the entire transcript		
12	of my deposition taken in the captioned		
13	matter or the same has been read to me,		
	and the same is true and accurate, save		
14	and except for changes and/or corrections,		
15	if any, as indicated by me on the		
16			
17	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET hereof, with the		
18	understanding that I offer these changes		
	as if still under oath.		
19			
20	SIGNATUREDATE:		
21	MICHAEL MACGILLIVRAY		
22			
23	Subscribed and sworn to on the day of, 20 before me,		
24			
25	Notary Public, in and for the State of		

						Page	1
1							
2	DEE	POSITION	I ERRA	TA SHEET			
3	Page No						
4	Reason for change:						
5							
6	Page No						
7	Reason for change:						
8	D 1-	.	-	C1			
9	Page Noto:						
10	Reason for change:						
11							
12	Page No			Change			
13	Reason for change:						
14							
15	Page No			Change			
16							
17							
18	Page No						
19	Reason for change:						
20							
21	Page Noto:						
22	Reason for change:						
23	<u> </u>						
24	SIGNATURE:	AEL MACO					
25	MICHA	ALL MACC	Λ דידיד דב	VAI			

,		Page 150
1		
2	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET	
3		
4	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
5	Reason for change:	
6		
7	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
8	Reason for change:	
9		
10	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
11	Reason for change:	
12		
13	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
1 Δ	Reason for	
15	change:	
	Page NoLine NoChange	
16	to:Reason for	
17	change:	
18		
19	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
	Reason for	
20	change:	
21	Page NoLine NoChange	
22	to:	
23	Reason for change:	
24	·	
	SIGNATURE:DATE:	
25	MICHAEL MACGILLIVRAY	

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	advised 27:23	29:14,25 30:12	argument 13:4	51:14 53:13 55:19
A A	88:23 108:21,21	35:25 41:20 46:24	Ari 3:8 6:6 41:9	56:24 59:17,18
a/k/a 74:2	110:18 113:4	47:4 49:7,8,10,11	47:2 96:25 98:24	65:14 92:15
able 20:15 28:13,13	AET 1:6	49:14 50:4 72:2	125:6 133:17	116:14,23
28:14 40:11 49:14	Affinity 54:19,25	72:20 77:20 80:13	138:2	assured 108:16
Absolutely 123:9	55:5,9,10,13	83:3 87:13 89:24	Ari's 16:4	attach 70:2
accept 126:21	56:22 144:8	101:19 112:2,3	-	attached 17:23
access 129:9 132:12	age 73:5	101.19 112.2,3	Ari.D.Kunofsky 3:9	42:7 55:7 128:14
132:15,17 133:6,8	agent 19:22 134:8	132:24	Arthur 57:19 61:24	attempt 78:18 79:4
accident 6:13	134:12	answered 84:6	ascertain 21:9	80:10 104:22
account 18:25 42:8	ages 73:3	answers 78:22	51:16 112:9	122:12 125:7,13
42:11 55:13 57:4	ago 16:14 124:10	Anthony 76:8	asked 32:18,19,20	127:25
65:21 66:6	agree 32:14	Antranik 57:6,19	32:21 33:19,20,21	attempted 79:6
accountant's	agreed 52:12	anybody 51:24	33:22 56:5 76:6	125:16
129:22		52:3 58:2 59:21	88:17 96:3 109:17	
accounting 76:10	agreement 4:10 71:7,15 80:16	59:25 76:10,16	125:6	attempting 124:23 127:21
129:9,16 136:8	141:24 144:23	126:21		
accounts 29:2 54:9		-	asking 35:21 55:24 58:11,12 70:19	attempts 125:9 126:6,15 132:7
accurate 148:13	agreements 81:6 ahead 10:19 20:23	anyway 24:4 apart 95:14 96:6	71:5 77:17	attention 38:15
acronym 110:8	41:11 54:5 61:19	_	assert 66:11	attorney 14:11,13
acronyms 91:12		apologize 17:8		• •
action 108:15,17	70:6 77:20 83:3	55:22 56:4 77:24 123:2	asserting 36:16 121:13	88:24 113:14,18
118:10 147:17	90:9 94:11 106:11	_	_	114:17 125:6
active 113:15	112:2 119:12	appeal 11:22	assertion 19:5	135:3 141:21
activities 85:19	123:18	appeals 10:3,4	27:11	attorney-client
activity 11:25	aid 131:20	appear 22:3 64:11 64:22	assessment 9:18,21	30:8,10 41:19
actual 39:3	al 1:8 148:7		51:4 95:3,6,19	106:23 107:2
add 57:16	allowed 35:25	appears 16:5 22:4	96:5,16 97:22	122:8,19
addendum 57:15	108:25	25:19 32:17 37:22	assessments 9:12	Attorneys 3:5,13
additional 22:12	alter 50:3	39:2 47:11 55:4	95:10,14 96:14	audit 9:8,17 10:4
address 5:23 20:12	amended 71:15	57:14,18 61:24 62:18 63:9 64:6	Asset 27:2,7 67:25	43:9 115:6
21:16,22 22:25	amendment 71:8		68:18 69:17,18	audits 49:16
35:9 54:3 80:20	71:17 144:23	64:17 65:24 68:9	72:11,12 75:23	August 17:11 94:17
80:21,22,24 87:24	AMERICA 1:3 148:5	68:21 71:14	79:25 99:25	authority 20:25
87:25 125:19		application 57:4,16	100:17 120:25	132:21 authorization 5:7
126:24 128:3	American 47:23	apply 133:11	121:3,5,6,7	
129:3 132:8	50:21 65:11	appreciate 59:3	141:23 142:4	57:5
140:14,17	amount 24:17	90:18 108:5 119:23	assets 15:21 28:12	authorized 57:17
addressed 17:12	25:11,12 141:11 amounts 42:18		28:23 43:18 66:12	Avenue 3:6
32:3 38:17 47:22		appropriate 111:18	66:13	B
64:2 81:10	amplify 80:12	111:21 113:20	assigned 8:24 9:12	bachelor's 136:9
addresses 53:17	analysis 120:13 123:6	133:2	11:6 12:4,13,17	back 17:11 26:17
administrative		appropriateness 78:11	110:6 139:6	26:19 32:19 51:20
9:25	analyst 137:14,16	· -	assignment 12:21	67:10 90:7,8 92:5
advice 115:5	and/or 57:16 60:10	approval 20:19,24	148:3	93:11 113:22
advise 112:12,23	80:10 84:8 148:14	April 62:19	assist 11:7,10 139:7	117:16 128:8
113:5	announce 130:6	area 44:12 129:10	assisting 139:3	137:11
	answer 21:20,21	129:23 132:12	associated 48:8	15/.11

haalvaraund 41,12	24.10 26.7 16	57.15 50.19 61.4	148:4	84:23 102:18
background 41:13	24:19 26:7,16 27:7 28:6	57:15 59:18 61:4		
114:15 135:15,24		116:15,23 120:17	cases 9:13 43:10	107:8 143:10
136:8	belief 13:15 54:4,6	124:15	cashier's 23:15	children 88:4,6
bad 43:13	believe 9:5 18:11	businesses 29:10	Cat 6:7 52:10 56:3	chime 29:15
balance 37:3 114:5	23:3 27:17 32:7	66:16 P -411-24-2-0-4-2	56:14 58:7 77:22	choice 98:25
balances 29:3	36:5 40:8,25 41:2	Butler 1:24 2:9 4:3	84:8,9 87:2	Circular 111:14
ballpark 123:25	41:5 42:7 44:6	147:7,24	107:19 123:17	claim 28:9 98:19
bank 16:19 17:22	54:3 57:10,13,23	button 100:5	133:17 134:18,23	clarify 55:24 56:6
17:22 21:16 23:10	66:14 68:24 72:9	$\overline{\mathbf{C}}$	138:2	clarifying 123:13
27:17 37:23 55:6	80:7,23 84:15	C 3:2 4:14,14 147:2	catch 124:5	clear 52:9 119:22
143:14 banks 50:19 66:10	88:11 95:18 106:4	147:2	CATRIONA 3:10	clearly 105:18
	115:14 120:4	cadre 136:21,24	Catriona.M.Cop	clicking 91:21
67:7	121:16 123:21	call 15:18 19:23	3:11 CEO 114:11	client 45:13 112:9
barks 41:13	124:13,13 127:14	20:4 59:15 71:22	certain 20:12	112:12,24 113:3,5 113:21
based 12:15,20	130:9,10,11 131:3	90:24 91:24		
13:7,10 30:7	132:20,25 136:19	105:23	certainly 43:22	close 103:11 133:22
32:25 41:23 70:22 75:16	139:20 believed 133:7	called 4:15 90:11	45:3 certificate 25:13	closer 73:2 closing 108:23
bases 27:11 28:8	benefit 27:9	calls 72:17 101:17	26:18	coincidence 95:15
basic 120:11,18	big 45:8 54:7	111:24 131:6	certificates 25:24	Coleman 108:22
basically 48:4	big 43.8 34.7 bills 48:5	132:22	certified 80:17,19	109:2 110:13
basis 28:6 30:16,18	bit 40:18 67:10	capacity 83:13	certify 147:9,15	colleagues 58:21
36:15,15 42:22	104:25 111:10	Caption 148:4	change 149:3,4,6,7	collect 9:12 85:20
78:10 123:5,5,7	113:9,10 134:3	captioned 99:24	149:9,10,12,13,15	104:22
Bates-stamped	blah 127:18,18,18	100:16 101:5,21	149:16,18,19,21	collecting 9:18
16:20 19:14 23:19	blanket 134:16	148:11	149:10,18,19,21	collecting 9.18
31:17 37:12 47:14	blood 147:17	car 6:13	150:8,9,11,12,14	11:19,23 12:16
52:23 54:20 60:17	BMFOLI 91:24	care 108:9	150:15,17,18,20	13:2,5 14:19
63:20 65:2 67:12	bold 75:16	careful 90:14,14	150:13,17,18,20	22:17 25:16 45:18
69:6 71:8 73:7	boring 59:8	carefully 41:20	changed 72:10	46:11 47:7 49:10
74:24 79:21 81:11	bothering 98:24	case 1:6 7:3,7,10	changes 148:14,17	50:13 84:11
81:21 82:5 89:13	bottom 25:10 74:10	8:25 9:19 11:8	character 43:15	104:20 112:10
94:2 97:5 98:4	108:14 116:2	12:21 15:25 17:14	characterization	collective 58:3
99:13 100:7,22	118:10	35:14,24 36:3	124:21	Collector 25:3
104:10 143:14,17	box 22:23 93:9	37:21 38:4 44:3	Charentz 121:7	combined 70:14,16
143:19,21,24	break 51:21 52:4	46:3 47:8 49:11	check 23:15 24:6,9	come 10:3 27:15
144:4,6,9,11,14	92:23 103:21	49:12,22 50:6	25:11,20 38:11,12	47:10 83:19,20
144:16,19,21,24	briefly 114:4	67:22 76:18,19	38:14,20,25 39:2	121:13
145:5,7,10,12,14	broad 113:13	85:25 86:13,24	39:4,6 40:15	comes 11:21 93:12
145:16,19,21,23	brought 38:11	89:4 90:16 92:13	62:19 64:17	124:6
146:5,7,9,12,14	brush 113:13	92:14 96:11 98:19	checked 23:2	coming 9:18
bathroom 103:21	builders 44:12	101:16 105:2,4	checks 23:12 24:16	comment 30:21,23
bear 23:9	building 35:18	106:7,9,14 110:5	33:5,9 38:9 62:14	43:10
bearing 48:9	129:10	111:21 114:22	64:12	common 117:3
began 139:19	bullet 85:18	117:5 120:3 121:2	Cherry 7:22 137:7	129:10,23 134:19
beginning 118:12	business 34:19 35:7	133:11 134:20	chief 4:20 5:8,11	commonly 74:10
behalf 18:21 24:18	35:8,22 36:17	135:3,8 138:24	41:8 45:25 58:8	communicate
			<u> </u>	<u> </u>

,]	
112:24	33:10 76:23 78:5	corporate 59:9	current 32:24	141:5,10,16
communication	79:6 108:22 109:2	Corporation	currently 56:7	144:18,21 145:4
15:16 106:18	109:5 110:23	115:10,12	137:13	deeds 141:2
109:2 110:22	112:7,9 113:3	correct 17:14 70:17	currently-not-col	Defendants 1:9
114:3	contacted 14:10	74:17 106:24	12:5,15	3:13
communications	77:17 141:22	132:16	customer 65:21	Defendants' 16:22
77:4 111:5	contacting 78:3	corrections 148:14		19:15 23:21 31:19
community 44:10	110:3	corrective 69:5,12	<u>D</u>	37:14 47:16 52:25
45:9	contained 89:22	70:3 72:16 144:21	D 37:9 143:2	54:22 60:19 63:22
company 28:5	contains 90:12	correspondence	D.C 3:7	65:4 67:14 69:8
39:11 114:11	context 23:8 32:13	37:18	D2 19:11,12	71:10 73:9 75:2
compelling 134:6	38:11 51:3 106:14	counsel 4:20 5:8,12	D3 23:17	79:23 81:13,23
complained 124:10	111:9,12,20 113:9	41:8 52:11 77:8	data 90:13	82:7 89:15 94:3
complaint 125:7,13	121:13	84:24 102:19	date 5:15 16:23	97:6 98:5 99:15
125:17 126:10	continued 93:20	107:8,20,20	19:16 23:22 31:20	100:9,24 104:12
127:22 128:20	104:4 114:2	108:21 109:5	37:15 47:17 53:2	143:12 144:2
130:12 131:2	Control 61:4 62:19	111:12 143:10	54:23 59:9 60:20	145:3 146:3
134:20 135:8	controlled 28:4	counsel's 45:25	63:23 65:5 67:15	defense 107:19
139:22	140:7,9,19	58:8	69:9 71:11 73:10	degree 136:9
complex 35:18	conversation 87:11	country 76:20	75:3 79:24 81:14	delicatessen 26:21
component 102:16	113:12 114:7	114:19	81:24 82:8 89:16	delinquency 46:10
components 78:8	cooperate 43:20	County 94:15	94:4 95:3,6,16	delivered 20:11
computer 89:21	cooperation 111:16	147:5	96:16 97:7 98:6	21:22 22:25
90:11,12 104:20	cooperative 111:8	couple 23:12	99:16 100:10,25	Demand 14:7
computers 97:12	copies 62:13	123:23 133:18,20	104:13 108:15,17	denied 87:22
97:13	Coppler 3:10 29:15	course 16:11 51:10	118:10 148:20	DEPARTMENT
concern 84:15	52:16,20 55:22	74:16 77:10 119:6	149:24 150:24	3:4
108:6	56:4,16 58:16	121:25 122:23	dated 17:11	depending 69:20
concerned 85:10	59:2 72:17,20	123:8	dates 95:19 96:5	deposition 1:14 2:6
107:23	77:15,24 78:15,20	court 1:2 4:2 5:5	day 37:4,4,4 142:23	4:5,22 5:6 6:6,9
concerning 85:17	78:24 82:16 83:2	9:13 10:2,5 11:21	147:21 148:23	6:15 38:12 85:14
conclusion 48:22	84:14 85:5,22	12:20 13:21 43:9	deadline 113:20	124:9 147:11,13
101:18 111:25	86:3,6,14 87:3,7	56:11	deal 45:8	148:2,11,16 149:2
132:23	101:17 106:25	cover 17:21 37:22	December 69:20,22	150:2
conducted 85:19	107:12 108:4,11	55:4 64:8 65:10	decision 26:12,12	depository 57:4
confidentiality	109:6 111:23	covered 123:21	48:10 135:2	describe 132:13
122:9	122:17 123:8,12	covering 60:23	decision-making	described 97:23
confronting 133:14	123:18 131:6	coworker 38:17	36:14,20 122:7	116:25
confused 67:3	132:22 133:24	CPA 76:8	DECLARATION	describing 51:3
connecting 52:17	138:3,9,14 142:7	create 119:13	148:8	description 74:6
connection 8:19	143:6	Credit 54:20,25	declare 148:9	designated 38:5
consequence 36:11	copy 62:13 80:16	55:5,11 144:8	deductions 43:7	desk 129:14
consideration	81:5 141:22	criminal 29:19	deed 67:12,20,22	determination 50:7
141:12	142:12	30:21 31:2	67:23 68:10,17	66:11
consistent 39:24	corner 65:22 91:9	criteria 20:14	69:5,12 70:3,3,19	determine 15:20,20
120:12 130:14	Corp 17:24 18:2,4	27:10	70:21,22 72:16	50:25 51:13 53:11
contact 14:6,21	18:7,11	curious 30:9 118:8	73:7,13,16,22	92:14 123:3
			<u> </u>	

determining 53:8	104:15 119:25	easier 115:23	et 1:8 148:7	expense 50:17,22
122:12	120:9,13 121:25	East 3:14	event 6:22 9:8	expenses 40:18,21
dialogue 14:14 44:2	documentation	education 136:7	69:24	48:8 51:13,17
86:23 89:7 111:12	16:5 36:24 120:16	effective 131:5	events 104:21	53:9,12 55:19
111:19	121:12	effort 48:24 58:11	105:4	56:24 64:19
Diane 61:3	documents 17:20	77:5	everybody 52:5,18	experience 111:19
difference 36:4	19:4 23:18 38:16	efforts 46:11 50:18	95:21	expired 13:6,22
101:16	49:25 60:16 62:10	egos 50:3	everybody's 37:4	expires 11:23
different 21:6	65:13 74:20 89:10	EIN 92:16	evidence 107:25	explain 85:6 90:20
34:15 91:18	89:12 99:12 102:4	either 16:7 82:22	ex-wife 68:25	96:12
100:14 137:3	121:9 122:15	84:16 92:9	105:25 106:4	explained 92:16
difficulties 52:13	143:18 144:11	electrical 64:18	117:10,22 139:11	extensive 121:20
dig 40:11	145:18 146:6	electronically	exactly 10:10 85:22	extensive 121.20 extent 31:3,9 49:24
digging 28:21	dog 41:13	75:14	127:20	77:16,18 78:2,3
direct 13:8 43:11	doing 17:9 48:13	ELZA 3:21	exam 85:14	87:12 109:6
50:17	48:17 58:22,25	employee 57:10,24	EXAMINATION	eye 65:16
directed 48:14	92:23 103:7,8	108:22	5:19 138:13 143:3	eyes 22:3,5
directly 62:25	DOJ 125:6 135:3	Employer 91:3	examined 4:17	
disagree 124:20	dollar 70:8 141:11	ended 94:22	examining 50:2	F
discern 29:5 48:16	141:13	entering 133:11	example 141:5,10	F 147:2
disclose 84:2	door 48:18 49:18	entertaining 26:24	exhibit 4:24 5:14	face 39:6
discloses 50:2	49:20,21 84:5	entire 148:10	16:22 19:15 21:21	facilities 88:19
discovered 122:23	127:5,12,17 128:9	entirety 123:4	23:21 31:19 37:14	fact 36:17 95:13
discovery 16:3	128:12,14 129:6	entities 35:8,16,20	47:16 52:25 54:22	96:4
discuss 31:2 107:14	129:11,12 130:3,8	35:22 36:18 40:3	55:24 56:6,12	factor 26:11 40:25
discussed 14:16	132:11	59:18 60:9 66:24	60:19 63:22 65:4	41:2 45:4,6 97:11
114:4 123:24	download 93:7,8	67:2,8 102:2	67:14 69:8 71:10	factors 122:11
Discussion 77:14	downloads 93:18	116:8,14,15,25	71:20 73:9 74:7	facts 85:16 123:16
138:12	Dr 40:16	117:5 120:17	75:2 79:23 81:13	123:22
dismissed 48:19,20	draft 86:5	139:25 140:8,9,13	81:23 82:7 89:15	factual 123:5,6
DISTRICT 1:2,2	drew 73:14	140:19	92:18 94:3 97:6	failing 27:25
Division 29:20	Driver's 59:7	entity 116:20	98:5 99:15 100:9	failure 43:20
dizzy 115:22	drove 126:8 128:4	entries 119:16	100:24 104:7,12	faint 56:3
document 16:25	due 52:12 114:6	entry 108:15 114:2	105:12 115:19	fair 51:4
17:10 19:18 20:2	duly 4:15 147:12	environment 6:18	143:9,13,16,18,20	Falcone 76:8,9,13
20:7 25:6 31:22		equipment 4:6	143:23 144:3,5,8	falls 87:12
31:23 32:3 42:15	E	ERRATA 148:2,16	144:10,13,15,18	familiar 25:8,15
55:2,3 56:12	E 3:2,2,2,2,20,20	149:2 150:2	144:20,23 145:4,6	57:22 120:2 121:2
58:14,15 60:25	4:14 143:2 147:2	erroneous 12:14,16	145:9,11,13,15,18	121:3,8
63:8 64:5,11 65:8	147:2	13:2	145:20,22 146:4,6	family 44:23 141:7
67:17 69:11,14	e-mail 77:3	erroneously 12:6	146:8,11,13	famous 44:11,15
71:13,14 72:3,5,9	earlier 24:11 68:7	ESQ 3:8,10,16	exhibits 92:21 99:3	91:11
73:20 76:3,5	109:16 117:2	essentially 30:22	143:7,11 144:1	far 15:15 53:7
78:13,14 83:8	119:19 120:14	EST 1:16 2:3	145:2 146:2	84:12
89:25 94:6,8	138:22 139:25	142:13	exist 31:3 122:15	faster 99:6
96:10 99:20,22	early 48:23 69:25	establish 58:10	existence 107:20	father 54:16
100:12,15 101:3	ease 102:6	estate 18:21 25:21	expend 50:17	February 1:15 2:2
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	I

33:8 147:22	five 34:20 93:15	full 71:25	106:11 111:3	
federal 54:19,25	95:14 96:5,7	funds 42:7	112:2 115:23	H 4:14
55:5,10 93:25	103:24 121:5,10	further 36:12 85:6	117:16 118:9	hair 61:4 62:19
94:9 97:4 98:3,12	flag 40:23	111:3 119:7,8	119:4,7,8,12	108:19
100:6,21 101:13	floor 129:20 130:3	147:15	120:6 122:2	hairdresser 34:8
102:8,14,15 144:8	132:14		123:18 128:23	hamstrung 113:10
145:21,23 146:4,9	flowing 29:9	G	133:19,19 138:10	Hanamirian 3:12
146:11	follow 63:3	G 4:14	goes 92:5 121:19	3:16,23 4:18 5:2
feelings 130:17	follow-up 134:4	Gandolfo 33:11	going 12:25 23:6	5:16,20 16:17,24
felt 113:19	138:19 139:22	38:12 57:18 124:8	26:18 28:16 30:11	19:10,17 23:16,25
fiduciary 75:24	142:10	125:2,9 126:23	38:9 41:15 42:15	24:5 30:2,14 31:4
field 104:20 137:18	following 107:7	128:4 129:13	45:20 48:17,24	31:6,21 37:8,16
figure 31:11	follows 4:17 93:21	130:4 134:5	49:7 52:9 56:9	41:10 45:23 46:8
file 8:6 22:16,18	104:5	Gary 7:16	99:5,10 103:6,10	46:18,21,25 47:5
29:18,21 45:17	foreshadowing	Gas 53:6,13	105:7,14 108:16	51:24 52:3,15,19
46:9 48:11 50:8	19:8	gathered 102:17	112:5 115:20	53:3 54:24 56:2,8
72:7 82:15,17	form 36:14 73:15	general 49:8,23	121:22 122:17	56:14,17,18 58:7
93:7,8	74:23 79:20 94:12	generally 46:4	130:7 137:10	58:23 59:4,6
filed 69:21 75:14	145:7,9	gentleman 7:16	138:3,20	60:21 63:24 65:6
92:3,3,7 94:10,12	formal 44:2	14:11 110:4	good 5:17 8:11 17:6	67:16 69:10 71:12
102:9,11 125:5	formed 27:9	germane 95:19	51:22,23 52:2,6	72:19,21,23 73:11
files 31:2 45:16	former 57:10,24	getting 71:25 91:21	52:20 56:14 73:4	75:4 77:21 78:7
62:11	formerly 6:24	give 37:10 52:6	73:5 92:25 99:11	78:16,21 79:2,3
filing 91:14,16	forms/correspon	62:10 93:15,15	137:8,22	81:15,25 82:9
92:16 102:13	118:11	99:3 113:20,20	government 91:12	84:7,21 85:11,23
Final 14:7	forth 28:7 147:12	131:2 133:18	graduated 135:25	86:4,10,15,18,25
finality 50:10	forward 61:18	given 4:12 6:9	grammatical 129:2	87:14,15 89:17
finally 137:6	found 21:20 124:19	15:12 20:11 21:23	granted 132:17	92:22 93:2,4,6,22
financial 15:4	129:13	22:25 73:19 96:15	granting 133:7	94:5 95:24 96:24
28:17 43:23 88:25	foundational 30:4	115:4 147:14	gratuitous 33:14,17	97:10,14,16 98:9
112:14,22	78:8,10	giving 131:12 138:5	GRIGORYAN	98:10,23 99:7,11
financials 15:6	four 12:2,11 14:2	glasses 63:10	3:21	99:17 100:11
find 19:3 28:13,14	34:14,20 42:19	glitch 93:17	group 17:18 37:21	101:2 102:24
28:22 40:11	121:4,10	go 10:3,19 16:9	59:24 76:10	103:5,12,17,22
fine 19:24 46:20	fourth 12:19 13:17	17:11 20:17,22	116:17 117:8	104:6,14 107:3,18
47:4 97:8,13	13:18	26:17 28:20 31:8	groups 137:4	108:7,12,13
103:13,23 142:10	fractured 123:2	32:25 35:5 36:23	guess 4:19 13:3	109:11,12 112:3
firm 3:12,23	frame 49:2 111:10	41:11 49:17,19,20	14:25 22:16 23:17	116:4,6 122:25
129:16	free 84:18 122:21	52:2 54:5 61:19	64:18 77:7 117:11	123:10,14,20
first 7:5 11:25 12:2	Freehold 6:2 8:2	64:10 65:15 67:10	132:15	124:4 133:17
17:9 61:13 65:24	137:2	69:3,4 70:6 71:19	guessing 73:2	134:2,17,22 135:4
74:15 102:8 106:5	freeze 8:12	74:20 77:11,19	guidance 137:18	135:6 137:21
109:17,18 116:18	Friday 1:15 113:25	81:18 83:3 90:7,8	guidelines 4:21	138:2,8,11 142:9
121:21 132:4	front 48:18 49:18	90:9 93:3,11	35:12	143:5
138:21 139:9	49:19 59:12	94:11 95:25 96:21	guy 110:19,19	hand 147:21
FirstEnergy 64:7	froze 96:2	96:24 97:14 99:6	guys 4:19 43:13	handed 130:11,12
fit 137:9	fulfilling 131:12	103:25 105:10,10	93:14 98:7	<u> </u>
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

handled 108:23	119:11,11,16,17	67:9	indicate 102:2	interacted 86:21
hands 41:14	121:19 146:14	How's 123:16	141:6	interaction 87:17
happened 11:24	hold 12:20 13:19	Howell 125:20	indicated 85:15	134:4,7
15:14 102:13	41:14 109:19	hundreds 105:9	87:24 109:18	interactions 124:25
125:12,14 126:4	110:3	nunui cus 103.9	112:7,11 140:18	125:8
129:5 130:25	holder 66:6		148:15	interest 42:20
happening 51:5	home 16:18 84:13	ICS 102:22 104:9	indicates 54:13	66:23
119:2	hoops 20:17	104:16,19,19	70:15 91:5 106:3	interested 147:18
happens 96:12	hopefully 78:11	106:3 146:14	indicating 17:22	interesting 73:13
hard 94:16 124:13	hours 123:23	ID 119:13 143:8,12	33:3 64:7 91:15	internal 5:12 89:20
Hasmig 68:12 74:2	house 54:4,4,7,7	144:2 145:3 146:3	indicator 35:19	90:10 111:13
Havighorst 57:20	88:7 125:18	identification 5:14	individual 20:12	130:17 133:10
61:25	126:11,25 127:2	16:23 19:16 23:22	21:11 80:22,24	137:17 143:10
head 65:23 124:3	128:5,8	31:20 37:15 47:17	94:21	internally 38:5
header 75:16	Hovnanian 1:8	53:2 54:23 60:20	indulge 17:8	75:11 110:2
headquartered	6:25 14:18,22	63:23 65:5,22	infamous 44:16	interrelated 116:24
36:18	15:4 18:4 21:14	67:15 69:9 71:11	information 15:4	117:4,5
heads 64:15	26:7 33:6,16 38:3	73:10 75:3 79:24	32:10 43:17 48:3	interrupt 20:22
hear 8:15 52:18	39:12 42:3 43:22	81:14,24 82:8	60:10 64:8 76:24	-
71:3,3 95:24	44:9 47:7,20	89:16 91:3 94:4	79:7 83:7,16 86:7	interrupting 55:23 interview 57:11,25
heard 33:15 39:22	51:18 53:10 54:10	97:7 98:6 99:16	88:25 92:17	investigate 49:16
82:25		100:10,25 104:13		S
	59:19 63:5,9 66:5	identified 17:13	112:13,14,22	investigating 109:7
held 2:7 4:5 13:19	66:17 67:24,25	59:21 76:8 78:12	113:6,19 114:10	investigation 15:19
77:14 138:12	68:12,18,22 69:17	82:14 98:17 104:8	114:25 116:9,11	48:21 58:13,20
help 6:21 131:19	72:11 73:25 74:2	106:22 111:7	117:24 119:24	84:19 105:5
helpers 138:25	75:25 76:15,19	121:24 130:10	120:2,18 131:23	122:24 139:4
helpful 19:4 37:3,3	77:6 80:3,4,11	identifies 75:24	initially 12:13	Investigations
helping 138:23	81:10 82:21 83:20	80:2	14:17	29:20
helps 45:22 hereinbefore	84:6 85:21 86:2	identify 117:7,9	injury 6:14	involve 87:9
	86:22 87:16 91:5	127:13 134:10	INOLE 90:24 91:2	involved 6:13 7:17
147:11	94:13 99:25 100:2	identifying 117:12	91:8	9:4,21 10:9 13:25
hereof 148:16	100:18 101:7,21	118:23 134:13	inquired 87:19	17:14 43:8 106:7
hereunto 147:21	102:3,7 115:4	identity 107:19	88:18	134:21 135:9
Hey 115:25	116:14,17,23	IDRS 90:11,12	inquiries 66:8,14	involves 41:19
Hilde 68:22 75:24	117:8,9 120:25	immediately 12:3	inquiry 53:11 inside 129:13 130:4	IRA 29:2 IRS 5:9 49:9 75:10
76:15,19 77:6,18	121:5,6,7 125:4,8 128:24 141:23	impose 122:12	130:7	85:19 92:15
78:3,5 79:5 82:2		imposing 124:19,24		
139:11,13	142:4 148:7 Hovnanian's 14:10	include 35:9	instance 10:13 21:12 56:21 94:22	104:21 108:22 127:18
Hill 7:23 137:7		including 34:2		
Hillman 31:25	54:16 68:14,25	income 15:21 59:9	102:8,12	is/was 80:5
33:23 34:2,6	105:24 106:4	94:21	instruct 30:12	issue 12:9 13:3 14:4
history 29:4 44:6	Hovnanian-related	Incorporated	41:15 49:7	30:5 82:22 109:8
45:15,18 46:10	35:8	33:10	instructed 29:24	114:20,21,22
47:7 88:17 92:16	Hovsat 33:9 34:25	independent 9:17	instructing 87:13	131:10
102:22 104:9,17	35:2,10 55:12,16	independently	instruction 30:17	issued 5:7 22:8
104:19 106:3	55:17,18 56:19	13:13	30:19	41:17 47:12
110:23 118:11	59:13,23 62:22,25	13.13	instructions 50:5	issues 51:2

item 105:16	knock 127:12,17	97:12 98:7 99:2,9	letters 14:7 80:14	lines 140:12
items 42:16 50:22	knocked 84:5 127:4	103:4,10,15	81:3 82:4 145:16	link 51:16
	128:12 129:6	115:25 125:6	level 106:8 124:21	listed 80:6,15 94:24
J	know 4:22 9:11,24	134:24 142:11	levies 118:20	literally 105:9
J 76:8	9:24 10:5 11:12		levy 41:3,7,17,24	litigation 9:19
January 33:5 69:20	12:24 15:20 18:10	L	42:4 118:12,14,15	12:20 13:19
69:23 73:17	20:10 22:10,11,14	L 3:20 4:14,14,14	118:16	109:19 110:3
JCP&L 64:18	27:21 28:14,15	L.P 39:10,20 42:3	liabilities 14:16	115:10 122:14
Jenssen 68:22	29:8,17,19 32:2	labeled 56:13	85:20,24,25 94:19	125:4,5 128:19,21
Jerry 31:25	34:13 35:2,16	Landing 135:21	94:20,24 98:17,18	139:19
Jersey 1:2 2:4 3:15	36:22 37:19 38:16	landlord 33:22,23	101:22,25 109:8	little 26:23 40:17
6:2 21:17 47:23	39:9,15,19 40:10	62:3,14	125:3	56:2 67:3,10 87:5
53:6,12 65:11	42:25 43:4,6 44:7	landlord's 61:12	liability 28:5 42:19	93:3 99:10 105:19
94:15 135:21	44:9,17 45:8 48:6	large 114:5,5	42:23 43:4 85:8	111:10 113:9,10
jmh@hanamiria	48:16 50:12,25	late 136:19	86:8,12,24 87:10	113:21 134:3
3:17	51:7 53:20 54:2	Laurie 107:7	87:18 89:4 94:13	136:4
job 1:25 137:8	54:14 57:8,21	Lavin 61:4 62:9	96:21 98:16	lived 87:20 88:6
John 3:16 23:23	59:10 60:25 62:13	LAW 3:12,23	104:23 106:8	living 88:19 139:14
45:22 52:12 95:22	65:9 66:19,19	laws 110:12	114:22	LLC 31:25
95:23 99:2 103:11	67:19 68:11,13,23	lawsuit 109:9	license 59:7	location 21:10,16
jokes 26:23	69:14 70:25 71:16	lawyer 28:17 29:7	lien 18:23 25:20,22	35:23 36:19 129:2
judgment 11:22	73:14,20 75:5,21	71:2	26:14 27:11 28:8	locations 125:18
43:14	76:6 77:3,19,22	learned 16:13	36:16 45:5 48:11	locked 132:12
July 108:15	78:2,4,10 80:4,8	lease 32:21 33:4	48:23 50:8 66:12	long 87:8 119:10
juncture 50:6	80:10,12 82:18	62:13	94:2,10 95:9	135:12 138:20
51:12	89:23 93:14 96:10	leases 36:25	96:16,18 97:5	longer 76:21
jurat 71:22	102:24 106:2	left 65:23 114:19	98:4,12 99:23	139:14
JUSTICE 3:4	107:11,16 110:16	115:23 128:13	100:7,13,22 101:5	look 16:15 25:8
	111:11,15 115:12	left-hand 65:22	101:14,23 102:8	34:12 64:15 67:18
<u>K</u>	115:13 116:20	73:16 91:8	102:15,16 121:14	67:18 70:21 95:18
Karen 33:10 57:18	117:21 121:18	legal 39:21 74:5	122:13 123:7	96:9 115:15
125:2,9 126:23	124:9,17 130:18	101:18 111:24	145:21,23 146:4,9	130:19
128:4 129:13,19	130:19 132:3	123:6 131:7,10	146:11	looked 29:21 34:14
130:4 131:13,19	135:16 141:2	132:23 140:6	liens 96:20 101:15	looking 20:3 39:3
132:11 134:5	knowing 142:4	let's 31:8 60:15	101:20,24 102:11	50:15 56:21,23
Katz 40:16	knowledge 9:16	63:18 64:23 66:6	102:20	60:22 63:12,12
keep 98:24 108:18	10:10 13:8 43:11	67:10 69:3,4	life 75:21	110:12
108:18 111:2	46:3 58:18 85:17	73:18 85:3 96:21	limited 84:10	looks 26:20 40:16
keeping 56:10	known 74:11	103:24 105:10	110:14	57:6 61:20 62:23
key 95:7	knows 69:24	letter 14:7,8 17:21	limiting 112:25	63:2,7 69:21
kid 142:5	Kunofsky 3:8 4:25	32:6 37:23 54:12	line 42:16 52:10	73:12,15 75:9,12
kind 20:17 40:23	5:4 8:17 23:23	55:5 60:23 61:3	57:6 65:24 71:21	75:14 94:14,17
58:10 62:16 93:24	29:15,23 30:10,20	61:21,22,23 64:6	85:9 105:16	104:16 118:22
103:2 104:25	38:10 41:12 45:20	64:8 65:10 81:9	114:12 149:3,6,9	loose 92:21
124:12 140:11,22	46:7,13,20,24	81:11,17,21 82:2	149:12,15,18,21	lose 19:11
knew 39:18 117:11	47:3 49:6 52:6	82:10,11 145:12	150:3,6,9,12,15	lost 37:9 75:21
117:15	93:23 95:21 97:8	145:14	150:18,21	95:22
	I	l	I	I

lot 21.10 51.7 9	112.1 112.1 114.1	manuiaga 147.17	middle 7:6	MM21 62.25
lot 31:10 51:7,8	112:1 113:1 114:1	marriage 147:17		MM31 63:25
75:20 105:8	115:1 116:1 117:1	matter 6:12,23 7:3	Middletown 21:17	MM35 65:7
116:24 117:3	118:1 119:1 120:1	13:22 14:19 31:2	24:7 25:2 26:22	MM47 102:21,23
lower-graded	121:1 122:1,21	31:12 35:21 38:3	67:24	104:8
139:5	123:1 124:1 125:1	42:21 47:19 58:20	Mike 19:21,23 38:2	MM5 69:4
M	126:1 127:1 128:1	108:24 112:11	41:15 51:21 53:5	MM8 74:22
$\overline{\mathbf{M}}$ 1:24 2:9 3:2 4:14	129:1 130:1 131:1	147:19 148:12	65:8 72:24 79:4	MM9 79:19
4:14 147:7,24	132:1 133:1 134:1	matters 11:12	80:9 84:10,17	moment 77:9
Mac 63:12,13	135:1 136:1 137:1	30:21 31:10	85:3,15 87:21	monies 29:9
MacGillivray 1:14	138:1,15 139:1	Mays 135:20	89:23 93:24 96:3	Monmouth 94:15
2:7 4:1 5:1,9,22	140:1 141:1 142:1	McCann 59:24	98:11 99:19 101:4	month-to-month
6:1,3 7:1 8:1 9:1	142:20 143:4	mean 9:16 10:8	104:7 105:17	33:4
10:1 11:1 12:1	147:10 148:21	21:4 26:16 28:15	109:13 115:25	Moorsetown 3:15
13:1 14:1 15:1	149:24 150:25	32:13 42:20 48:21	127:8 135:9	Morgan 37:23 41:4
16:1 17:1 18:1	MacGillivray's 5:6	66:25 70:12 72:6	137:24	42:4
19:1 20:1 21:1	mail 20:11 21:15	77:2 84:7,22	million 115:11	morning 128:4
22:1 23:1 24:1	21:22 22:23,24	104:18 105:8	millions 42:25	mother 68:15,16
25:1 26:1 27:1	80:17,19	107:13,14,18	mind 35:19 36:9,10	mouse 116:2
28:1 29:1 30:1	mailed 80:19	112:22 113:8	36:19 124:6 138:5	move 60:15 73:4
31:1 32:1 33:1	mailing 21:16	114:21 118:5	minds 21:6	movies 26:5
34:1 35:1 36:1	main 3:14 54:3	132:10 134:3	minor 88:3	Moving 31:13
	maintained 55:13	137:15 140:6,7	minutes 16:14	106:21
37:1 38:1 39:1	major 70:23	meaning 53:24	93:16 103:24	multiple 35:7,22
40:1 41:1 42:1	making 73:3	68:5 70:17 71:4	133:18,20 138:5	36:17 96:14 97:22
43:1 44:1 45:1	Mall 32:2,7 55:19	72:4	mismarked 24:3	139:25
46:1 47:1 48:1	56:25 60:24 61:5	means 29:6 110:2	mistake 110:9	municipal 18:12,14
49:1 50:1 51:1	64:19 74:11,12	medical 17:17,24	MM 23:6	mute 41:9 52:10
52:1 53:1 54:1	87:25 88:20	17:25 18:4,7,11	MM001 93:23	133:19
55:1 56:1 57:1	125:19 129:3	34:7	MM04 67:11	N
58:1 59:1 60:1	140:14 141:15	meet 33:25 34:4	MM07 71:6,20	-
61:1 62:1 63:1	man 43:14	meeting 124:12	MM1 93:5 97:25	N 3:2,20 143:2
64:1 65:1 66:1	manage 105:20	members 141:8	98:16 101:12	name 4:2 5:21 27:2
67:1 68:1 69:1	manager 136:21,24	membership 57:15	102:9	34:9 39:5,21 44:9
70:1 71:1 72:1	137:4,6	memo 45:25 58:9	MM11 81:9	44:11 54:10 57:22
73:1 74:1 75:1	Manahawkin 2:4	memorandum 4:20	MM12 81:20	57:23 65:24,25
76:1 77:1 78:1	manuals 137:18	5:13 84:24 143:10	MM13 89:18,19	72:10
79:1 80:1 81:1	March 113:25	memory 27:24	MM15 73:12	named 7:16,18
82:1 83:1 84:1	marked 5:13 16:21	88:17	MM17 16:16,18	14:11 34:8 114:11
85:1 86:1 87:1	19:15 23:20 31:18	mentioned 122:20	MM19 19:9	114:17
88:1 89:1 90:1	37:13 47:15 52:24	138:21 139:16	MM2 96:25 97:17	napkin 42:22
91:1 92:1 93:1	54:22 60:18 63:21	140:12	97:25	narrative 51:7
94:1 95:1 96:1	65:3 67:14 69:7	met 34:6 139:9	MM21 37:6,7	114:13
97:1 98:1 99:1	71:9 73:9 74:25	methods 49:9	MM23 60:23 63:8	Nasky 107:7
100:1 101:1 102:1	79:22 81:12,22	Michael 1:14 2:6	MM26 99:18	Natural 53:6,13
103:1 104:1 105:1	82:6 89:14 94:3	5:22 142:20 143:4	MM27 100:4	nature 62:15
106:1 107:1 108:1	97:6 98:5 99:14	147:10 148:21	MM3 98:2,8	137:20
109:1 110:1 111:1	100:8,23 104:12	149:24 150:25	MM30 56:13 59:12	Navesink 21:15
	l	l	l	I

52.12 10 10 CE 14	4i 00:15 02 25	06.12	25.10 10 27 0	115.10 116 16
53:13,18,18 65:14	notice 90:15 93:25	occasions 96:13	25:18,19 26:8	115:18 116:16
68:8 83:24 86:22	94:9 97:4 98:3	126:22 128:16	27:5,19 28:2,2	118:4,19,21 119:9
87:23 88:4 125:18	100:6,21 102:15	occur 104:22	29:12,16 30:2,19	119:12,20 120:8
139:10 141:5	118:12,14,15	occurred 105:4	31:4,5 32:12 33:7	120:19,23 121:17
necessarily 50:16	125:7,13,16	125:9	34:10,18,24 36:6	123:17,20 124:2,7
necessary 122:4	126:10 145:21,23	occurs 96:15	36:21 37:6,25	125:11,11,24
need 5:17 6:20	146:4,9,11	Ocean 136:25	38:7,24 39:8,14	126:3,13,16,19
19:21 30:25 36:22	Notices 101:13	October 81:9	39:17 40:4,7,14	127:3,11,16,23,23
36:23 51:21 52:4	102:7,14	offer 4:23,24	40:14 41:25,25	128:6,11,15,22
71:19 92:23,24	notions 44:22	148:17	42:6,9,9,13,13,17	129:18,24 130:23
122:4	number 16:15	office 5:8,11 7:21	43:2 44:20 45:2,2	131:15,24 132:6,9
needed 112:9 113:2	25:14 35:16 65:7	7:23 8:2 16:4	45:11,11,14 46:13	132:19 133:4,9,16
137:4	91:4 92:17 96:25	20:8 25:2 34:13	47:5,9,25 50:9,11	133:16,24 134:22
neither 44:19	107:24 119:14,17	34:16,19 35:7	51:19,19 52:15	135:4,4,11,19,22
never 18:9 33:15	numbered 84:25	41:8 46:5 102:18	53:4,15,23 54:17	136:3,6,11,11,17
New 1:2 2:4,10	numbers 37:10	107:8 129:9,12,16	54:17 55:21 56:17	136:20 137:5,19
3:15 4:3 6:2	numerous 139:17	129:22 130:5	56:19 57:2 58:8	137:21,21 140:4
21:17 47:23 53:5	0	132:16 143:10	58:23 59:8 60:15	140:10 141:14
53:12 65:11 94:15	$\overline{\mathbf{O}}$ 3:2,20	officer 7:4,7 8:9,23	61:6 62:4,7,16,17	142:2,7
135:21 147:3,5,8	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	10:21 15:23 17:13	62:24,24 63:18	old 136:25
nice 73:15	oath 124:14 138:16 148:18	37:20 64:2 134:10	64:20,23,23 65:12	once 14:3 99:4
night 4:18		135:20,23 136:5	65:15 66:6,21	one's 97:18
Nina 105:25 106:2	object 45:21 77:16	136:18 137:11,12	67:9 68:3,16 69:2	ones 34:22
117:9,15,20,22	77:25 122:18	officer's 20:25	70:9,24 71:6	open 99:4 103:19
noise 73:3	objecting 29:23	officers 7:9 8:24	72:13,19,24,25	127:5 129:12
nominee 18:23	objection 5:3 30:25	10:16 11:7 58:4	74:4,4,18 75:20	130:3,8 132:11
26:13,13 27:11	72:17 82:16,24 87:7 101:17	138:23 139:6	75:22 76:5,14,22	opposed 46:3
28:8 36:16 41:3,7		offices 34:8	78:7,24 79:2,8,11	option 48:18
41:24 45:5 48:11	106:25 111:23	oh 9:2 11:9 13:12	79:11,17 81:2,7	oral 85:14
48:23 50:8 51:3	131:6 132:22	13:16 41:10 42:10	82:12 83:5,17,25	order 23:7 55:16
66:12 99:23,25	objective 21:3,7	51:21 88:6 103:22	84:4,21 86:10,15	82:20 142:12
100:13,17 101:5,6	48:15 53:7	124:4 135:22	88:2,9,12 89:9,9	organization 76:11
101:15,24 102:11	obligation 111:11 122:9	136:11 137:5	90:2,5,9,10,19,22	original 101:20
102:16,20 118:16		OIC 114:4	90:25 91:7,25	102:14
121:14 122:12	obligations 111:14 obtain 59:17	okay 6:20 7:14,19	92:4,11,11,19	originated 43:4
123:7	obtain 39.17 obtained 76:4	7:24 8:3,10,18 9:2	94:18 95:8,23	outcome 147:18
nominees 50:3	78:13	9:3,6,14,22,22	96:17 97:15 98:14	outset 60:7
102:2		10:12,22 11:9,9	98:21 99:11 100:3	outside 13:14
non-collectible	obtaining 43:17,18 obvious 21:4	11:16,16 12:12,12	100:19 101:3,8,11	owed 85:20 86:2
13:9	obviously 6:23	12:23 13:16,16,23	103:4,8,8 104:24	94:13 101:22
nonevent 36:7	31:12 32:20 76:18	13:23 14:9,20,24	105:6,7 106:6,17	owned 6:13 27:24
normal 50:13 51:10	77:2 83:12 107:23	15:8 16:2,2 17:6,7	106:20 107:3,4,6	29:10 39:11 66:16
Northwest 3:6	117:10,14 121:20	17:9 18:16,18	107:9 108:4,7	140:2,6
notary 2:9 4:4,16	125:2	19:2,7,7 20:5,9,13	109:11 110:7,17	owner 26:17
71:22 147:7	occasion 6:11 79:13	21:18,24 22:6,14	110:25,25 112:4	owner's 27:2
148:24	127:4,6 128:2	22:19,19 23:5,5	112:15,20,20	owners 117:7,19
noted 142:13	141.7,0 140.4	24:13,13,24,24	113:7,23 115:8,8	ownership 51:2

66:23 117:4 140:6	parentheticals	person 4:13 25:24	106:22	25:16 40:24 41:18
00.23 117.4 140.0	117:13	79:14,16 139:10	Post 20:8	43:9,16 45:4
P	Paris 67:23 68:12	140:20	postal 19:13 20:3,4	48:13 50:13 57:12
P 3:2,2,20	74:2 117:19 121:6	personal 10:10	20:18,21,24 22:7	80:5 105:2 107:24
P.C 3:12,23	part 16:7 18:22	40:18,20 85:17	22:10,12 139:17	108:2 122:7
p.m 1:16 2:3	22:15 23:7 36:13	137:8	139:18,22 143:16	125:21 128:24
113:25 142:13	36:15 37:21 43:21	personnel 10:16	potentially 42:11	131:5,9 133:2
P1 85:2,2	46:11 72:7 114:6	persons 60:13	43:19 117:9	134:13
Pachava 27:2,7	participated 7:7	perspective 35:11	122:19	processed 12:17
69:18 72:12 75:23	participated 7.7	50:14 113:17	power 14:11 88:24	139:23
79:25 100:17	particular 13:6	pertinent 104:21	113:11,14,18	produce 62:10
121:3 141:20	23:14 38:21	105:3 123:22	141:21	produced 75:6
page 16:25 17:3,11	particularly 111:20	Peter 80:3,4,11	precipitated 72:15	product 122:21
24:25 26:19 55:14	parties 4:11,11	81:10	precipitating 9:8	production 23:11
57:5 59:11,11,12	147:16	phone 77:4 79:14	preconceived 44:22	24:22 38:15 82:14
61:13,23 63:6	partnerships	phone 77.4 77.14 phonetic 34:9	premises 124:15	professional 60:4
64:12 71:21,21,24	110:14,15	physical 39:4	133:12,13	professionals 60:5
74:5,6,15 84:24	patience 16:14	picture 71:25	Prep 31:25	60:8
84:25 85:12 89:19	Pause 133:25	piece 9:21 36:16	prepared 6:7	program 137:13,15
89:24 91:17,18	pay 28:5	pile 92:21	preparer 59:22,23	prohibited 85:15
105:13,15,15	payable 24:16 33:6	placed 12:4	76:7	proper 133:8
108:14 111:3,4	33:9 38:13 62:20	Plaintiff 1:4 3:5	preparers 60:3,4	properties 53:21
113:24 114:18	63:6	Plaintiff's 5:13	present 13:4 20:7	68:10 141:3
115:19 116:7,11	paying 48:4 51:13	143:8	pretty 21:4 59:8	property 18:13,14
118:9,22 119:5	53:12 62:25	plan 29:13	113:13 134:6	18:20 24:9 25:16
120:5,20 122:2	payment 18:12,24	play 121:13	previous 119:5	25:21 28:5 48:9
143:3 149:3,6,9	24:10 26:6 27:6	played 36:19	previously 52:12	48:12 51:14 55:20
149:12,15,18,21	48:8 53:9 56:24	playing 16:18	139:16	56:25 64:19 67:25
150:3,6,9,12,15	66:15 67:8	plaza 34:12,14	primary 8:8,22	68:18 69:17 73:25
150:18,21	penalty 42:21	please 46:16 55:23	prior 47:6 92:6	74:6,8,12 86:23
pages 71:19 105:8	148:8,9	56:6 61:14 90:8	107:16	120:18 139:10
105:9 121:21	Pennsylvania 3:6	91:19	private 25:24	141:5,6
paid 18:19,20	people 18:9 44:14	PNC 16:19 17:21	privilege 107:2	propriety 107:15
24:19 25:22 26:16	80:15 140:20	19:3 23:10,10	privileged 107:21	protected 93:8,9
51:17 55:18 59:22	perception 124:23	24:21 143:14	probably 13:10	122:8
62:14 64:17 76:7	perfect 78:24 87:4	POD 137:2	30:17 73:18 97:2	provide 75:7 93:24
paper 21:5 24:4	138:18 141:19	point 13:22 15:18	97:10 107:15	112:12 113:5
31:10	period 11:22 12:19	22:23 29:22 34:7	133:22	131:22 137:18
papers 82:19	13:17 94:22 97:20	44:4,7 58:2 67:2	problem 35:13 46:5	141:22
paperwork 12:17	98:13 110:6	72:7 77:6 82:18	problematic 108:3	provided 28:19
31:9	periods 12:2 14:3,4	82:22 102:6	procedural 134:16	32:8 43:23 66:15
Paragon 5:25 7:20	94:21 109:20	110:19 114:9	procedures 133:10	113:18 114:10
paragraph 105:22	perjury 148:8,9	131:8	proceedings 93:20	providers 50:22
105:23 117:18	permission 26:13	points 85:18	104:4 133:25	provides 91:3
parameters 4:21	48:11 50:7 102:19	polite 112:6	process 6:6 9:9	providing 32:10
45:24	permitted 58:17,19	politely 108:8	10:2,17 11:18,19	64:8 65:13 88:24
paraphrase 124:18	86:8	portions 30:6	14:5,5 15:15 16:4	114:14,24
	1		1	

provisions 114:4	21:5 30:24 39:18	126:2,23 127:9,20	101:22	48:10 50:7 112:13
public 2:9 4:4,16	46:23 63:10 94:16	128:10,13,17	reflects 75:20 96:16	139:18
49:25 132:11,15	101:6 111:5,6	130:16 131:22	120:9	requested 14:17
147:8 148:24	148:10,12	130:10 131:22	refreshing 88:17	15:5 62:12 64:9
publicly 39:23 40:5	reading 13:11	141:4,16,25	regular 118:20	89:2 92:12 118:12
pull 85:3 91:19	ready 90:7 138:6	receipt 25:3 26:21	relate 68:9 90:15	requesting 80:15
103:9	real 18:13,21 25:16	received 12:2,21	97:20	81:4 102:19
pulling 104:7	25:21,21 120:18	15:9 21:15 25:11	related 147:16	required 20:19
purchased 25:25	realize 61:18	75:10 107:6	relates 74:9	43:25
purity 107:24	really 28:25 42:24	recess 93:19 104:3	relationship 55:9	requirement 91:16
purpose 21:13	43:10 44:8,19	recognize 37:17	55:10	requirements
51:15 58:5 92:13	80:8 91:17 110:16	67:17 71:13 99:19	relative 4:20 6:23	91:14
133:14	113:11 123:23	104:15	17:16 35:20 36:24	research 116:13
purposes 30:4 89:3	127:9 128:13	recollection 39:16	42:2 45:13 80:7	120:11,15
pursuant 2:8 4:10	reask 46:16		101:14	resided 87:24 88:4
pursuing 28:8	reask 46:16 reason 8:6 15:12	39:25 40:2 41:23 55:12 106:10	relatively 6:12 49:3	88:11
pursuing 28:8 put 13:9 52:8 78:9	22:21 30:3 50:12	130:21	relatively 6:12 49:3 released 25:23	residence 21:10
115:25	65:18 85:6 106:24	record 5:17,21,24	remained 12:19	87:20
113:23	149:4,7,10,13,16	26:13 30:6 33:13	remains 108:18	
Q	, , , ,	46:23 52:8 77:12	remember 7:11	residing 87:23 resolution 43:24
quarters 114:18	149:19,22 150:4,7			44:3
question 29:7,25	150:10,13,16,19 150:22	77:14 80:24 102:19 103:25	12:10 27:23 38:20	_
30:13 33:18 41:21			42:20,22 130:15	respect 13:6 48:22
45:22 46:15,17	reasons 107:25	104:17,21 138:10	remind 44:15	84:11 85:13 86:24
49:15 50:4 58:12	137:8	138:12 147:13	Remote 1:14 2:6	98:15 112:21
78:23 80:13 83:3	Rebecca 7:18,25	recorded 69:23	remotely 4:10	125:3 132:10
83:4 86:17 92:6	127:14 129:8	94:14,17 99:24	remove 57:16	respectfully 77:3 84:23
123:2	recall 7:9 10:8	110:23 113:2 records 16:19	renewal 32:23 rent 36:25	
questioning 23:8	12:11 14:12,15 15:13 17:20 18:5	17:23 27:18 37:24		respecting 35:12 respond 88:21
101:12	18:25 19:6 21:19	43:23 54:20 55:6	rental 32:10 33:5,9 Renty 108:22 109:3	131:21
questions 6:5,8	22:9,12,22 23:4	56:23 66:15 92:15	110:13	response 31:16
32:18 80:9 134:16	24:15,20,23 25:5	102:17 143:14		32:8 33:18 37:11
138:4,19 140:24	25:9 27:22 29:3	102.17 143.14	repeat 46:19 77:22	52:22 53:22 63:19
quick 103:20	29:11 33:24 34:5	red 21:16 40:23	repetitive 121:24 report 91:18	64:25 75:7 88:14
quite 30:11 121:20		redacted 30:7	102:17	
quite 50.11 121.20	40:13,22 42:12,24			88:22 107:7 112:25 143:21,23
R	44:5,8 47:6 55:8	106:23 107:10,13	Reported 1:23	,
R 3:2,2,20 4:14	55:18 57:23 58:6	redactions 107:16	reporter 4:2,7 5:5	144:6,13,16
17:12 147:2	59:14,16 60:2,11	redemption 25:13 reference 105:13	56:11	responses 33:2 75:15
Rankin 14:12	60:14 62:8,12		represent 14:18,23	
15:16 44:7 60:6	66:20,22 76:2,12	referring 109:22	15:3 112:10 113:4	responsive 16:6
111:6,6,8,18	76:20 80:18 81:5	117:12	representatives	responsiveness
112:5 114:9,24	83:6,16 88:16,22	refers 35:2 109:4	57:17	111:21
Ranney 38:13	89:8 106:15,19	reflect 35:15 46:9	representing 73:24	rest 108:16 114:12
rationale 8:4	109:16 110:24	92:2 101:25 105:3	represents 69:15	result 41:6 43:19
reach 76:24	112:6,7 115:17	reflected 45:17	69:16 116:12	resulted 9:13 115:6
read 5:10 14:11	117:23 119:17	101:23 119:25	request 16:6 20:18	115:11
	123:23 125:17,23	reflecting 95:9	26:12 41:2,7	return 43:5 59:9,16
	-		-	

75:13 78:14 83:7	River 21:15 53:14	script 46:22	sequencing 8:5	101:7,14,14,14,21	
95:5 97:22	53:18,19 65:14	scroll 103:2 105:11	118:24	102:3,7 105:21,24	
returns 27:18	68:8 83:24 87:23	scrolling 111:2	series 38:8 42:14	106:4 117:12,19	
59:17 92:2,7	88:4 125:18	115:22	42:16 48:14 64:12	120:25 125:3,8,22	
reveal 86:7	RO 108:21 136:15	search 28:24	74:19,21 98:22	125:23 126:2,10	
revealing 85:7	road 21:15 36:13	searching 43:24	116:8	128:24 131:16,20	
revenue 5:12 7:4,6	53:14,18,19 65:14	second 52:7 55:14	serve 125:7,13,16	132:2,8 139:9,13	
7:8 8:8,22,24	68:8 83:24 86:22	67:18 95:20	126:9 127:21	139:21 140:2,7,9	
10:16,20 11:7	87:23 88:5 125:19	115:21 116:3	128:24 131:16	141:23 142:4	
15:23 17:13 20:25	roadmap 105:2	127:24 129:20	132:2,8 134:19	148:7	
37:20 50:16,20	role 7:2 10:13,18	130:2,7 132:14,14	139:21	Shant's 28:23 39:5	
58:4 64:2 89:21	10:20 36:19	Section 84:14 85:10	served 41:24,25	55:10 131:19	
90:10 111:13	136:15	see 14:22 19:19	42:4 135:7	141:21	
134:10 135:20,23	room 4:8 63:14	21:14 24:6,13	server 133:2	shared 16:12	
136:5,18 137:11	Rutgers 136:2	31:14,23,24 38:16	service 5:12 9:10	sharing 35:17	
137:12,17 138:23	Rutledge 7:17,22	38:18,19,22 44:18	13:5,13 29:20	103:16 140:13,16	
139:6 143:10	119:18	48:14 49:4 54:18	46:12 53:17 80:25	SHEET 148:2,16	
reversed 110:5	<u> </u>	55:2 56:22 61:13	89:21 90:11	149:2 150:2	
right 5:18 13:25	S 3:2,20,20 67:25	62:22 64:13,14,16	110:15 111:13	shelter 43:7	
14:3 20:16 22:5	69:17 73:25 91:5	65:19,25 69:11	113:6 125:21	shifted 72:25	
23:17 24:2,4 31:7	sale 25:13,16,24	71:20 74:15 86:20	126:21 131:5	short 6:12 49:3	
32:4,9,15,18 37:5	26:18	90:4 91:8,14	135:13 136:13	shortcut 28:16	
38:4 39:5 40:16	Sarkes 57:7,19	92:17 93:12,16	143:10	show 89:23 90:4	
41:11 42:13 44:13	sat 6:16	94:6 98:7,11	Services 32:2	120:4 141:11	
45:5 46:7,15 47:2	satisfied 25:20	103:5,9,18 105:17	serving 131:9,20	showed 56:24	
47:20 50:17 52:5	save 148:13	105:18 109:23	set 17:20 91:13	66:15 101:20	
52:5,17,18 53:17	saw 58:15	110:4 113:3 119:4	147:11,21	showing 56:7 59:11 shown 101:25	
54:11 55:16 56:10	saying 8:14,19	119:13 130:20	setting 28:7		
56:15 58:4,5,25	13:18 27:8 29:8	133:20 134:17	settlement 115:11 Shant 1:8 6:25 18:4	shows 91:14	
58:25 59:5 60:22	45:9 70:18 73:6	seeing 24:20 25:5,9 29:3 44:5 50:14	21:14 24:18 26:7	shuffle 82:19 shut 103:15	
61:10,25 62:5	75:17 96:9				
63:14,16 64:16,21 66:4,5,24 67:6	says 17:17,17 21:22	59:14 62:21 76:2 116:18	27:9,13,20,24 28:12 33:15,23	side 10:14 49:21 115:24	
71:2 73:16,18	24:2 25:7,10	seeking 43:16 45:4	35:20 38:3 39:12	sign 5:10	
75:11,18 76:11	26:25 27:4 32:9	50:24 60:9	42:2,19 43:12,21	sign 3:10 signature 57:6	
81:18 83:10,11	32:14 33:12 58:17	seeks 48:3	44:22 45:16 46:14	71:21 148:20	
85:2 86:16 87:2	63:4 66:5 74:10	seeks 48.3 seen 39:19	47:19 48:22 51:17	149:24 150:24	
92:19,24 93:5,10	85:13,25 93:7	segues 120:17	53:9 54:16 59:19	signed 61:24	
93:11 96:23 97:21	94:20 105:21,24	send 5:4 11:23	60:10 66:17,18,18	significance 26:9	
97:23 98:8 108:3	108:20 109:23	15:24 80:14 137:3	67:25 68:14,18,24	67:21 70:2,23	
108:12 112:22	113:11 114:16	sense 11:2 67:6	69:17 72:11 79:9	95:12 96:4,7	
113:10,13 116:7	117:18	132:5	79:11,12 82:10,11	141:2	
118:5 124:7 126:9	scenario 37:2	sent 4:19 14:6 16:4	82:14,21 83:20	significant 69:19	
129:21 130:20	Schonbraun 59:23	22:13 80:18,23	84:5 85:20 86:2	140:15	
133:23 135:5,22	School 38:13	139:17	86:21 87:16 91:5	signing 62:2	
137:23 138:7	screen 16:13 24:2	separate 54:9 94:23	92:9 94:13 99:24	similar 140:20	
140:2	63:13 116:2	sequence 99:3	99:25 100:17	141:17	
				,	

simple 35:21	78:19 79:5,12	stay 45:24 58:24	127:22 128:14,18	talking 24:10 58:3
single 68:10	80:10 83:19 88:23	96:11	128:20 130:12	58:9 66:25 67:5,6
sir 6:8,19 13:20	102:4 106:13	stem 43:3	131:2 134:20	115:9 118:17,23
15:7,11,13 17:15	108:25 109:9	stemmed 18:12	135:7 139:21	task 131:12
17:25 19:24 45:10	113:21 124:22	Stephanie 1:24 2:9	143:21,23 144:3,6	taught 136:4
47:18,21 74:17	130:24	4:3 19:11 23:17	summons-summ	tax 7:3 9:13 10:2,5
75:19 81:17 90:17	speaker 52:17	46:19 56:9 147:7	128:19	11:21 12:20 13:21
97:24 109:14	speaking 27:23	147:24	summonses 15:24	18:14,20 24:9
124:6 129:4,17	41:9 76:12 106:15	stepped 137:7	48:14 50:19,20	25:3,13,15,20,21
136:14 137:25	specific 46:2	steps 130:2	supervising 10:15	25:24 27:18 28:5
sister 117:15,22	specifically 23:4	stipulate 4:11	supervisor 8:23	28:17 31:25 42:20
118:2	33:24 38:22 59:15	stop 15:15 95:21,22	11:6 139:7	43:5,9 45:15
sit 117:21	specifics 42:25	straight 114:12	supervisory 10:14	46:10 59:9 60:4
sitting 90:3	speculation 72:18	136:12	10:18	78:13 83:7 85:7
situation 141:18	Speedus 39:13,15	Street 3:14	support 19:4 29:6	85:20,24,25 86:7
six 22:4	39:19 40:5 114:11	strike 38:14 40:20	sure 6:6 49:18 54:2	86:24 87:9,17
sixth 105:22	115:9	struck 24:21	58:24 61:15 77:23	94:2,9,19,21 95:4
size 63:13	SpeedusNY.com	stuff 15:6 59:8	80:8 103:22 107:5	95:4,11 96:15,21
skipped 61:18	39:4,10,20 40:8	71:23 118:16	117:17 126:7	97:5,20 98:4,12
skipping 140:23	40:10 42:3	sub-trusts 142:5	131:14 133:15	98:13,16,18 100:7
small 29:3 45:9	spoke 33:20 44:6	subject 18:22 35:13	138:8,11	100:22 101:14
105:19 141:11	60:7 109:7 119:19	86:12 87:11	survey 41:3	102:8,14,15
smaller 54:4,7	spoken 76:7 122:10	122:13	sworn 4:9,13,16	104:23 106:8
97:18	122:14	subpoena 2:8 53:5	142:22 147:12	109:8 110:12
sociology 136:10	SS 147:4	63:19 64:25 75:8	148:23	114:21 145:21,23
somebody 13:3,4	stamp 69:22 73:19	144:13,16	SY001289 148:3	146:4,9,11
37:20 75:7 110:11	standing 70:10,11	Subscribed 142:22	system 75:6,13	taxes 18:13 25:7
110:13 130:19	Stanley 37:23 41:4	148:23	89:21 90:11,12	26:25
somewhat 112:18	42:5	subsequent 22:9,11	104:20 113:15	taxpayer 84:12
son 6:12 88:10	start 52:14 135:16	23:2 71:24	systemic 118:11	90:13 113:12
soon 19:12	135:17	subsequently 15:2	T	114:10 133:14
sorry 8:11 10:19	started 9:9 15:19	substance 29:4		taxpayer's 114:16
20:22 26:23 35:4	109:17 120:22	127:10	T 3:2,20 147:2,2	133:12
41:11,12 44:8	startled 130:13,20	substantive 71:24	tabs 103:11 take 8:5 18:8 52:10	team 11:4,5 58:11
46:17 54:5 66:3	starts 105:24 114:3	substitute 136:4	67:18 103:24	76:17
70:6 77:21 82:19	State 2:10 4:3 5:21	sued 6:15	108:9 115:20	technical 52:13
85:5 95:25 140:22	5:23 147:3,8	suggested 109:5	126:5 138:20	93:17
sort 16:6	148:25	suggesting 30:16	taken 93:19 104:3	techniques 49:9,23
sought 43:23	statement 25:7	36:2	148:11	50:2 TEED 4 109:22
source 83:16 92:8	26:25 115:16	suite 5:25 36:8 suites 34:17,19	talk 49:21,22 57:11	TEFRA 108:23
sources 50:15,16 50:20	statements 28:18	suites 34:17,19 sum 68:2	59:20 77:6 83:18	110:9,10 tell 7:15 18:8 29:18
space 35:17	States 1:2,3 52:11 139:14 148:5	sum 68:2 summons 16:7,8	86:11 87:10	41:16 63:4 64:4
space 33:17 speak 28:18 58:17	status 12:5,15 13:9	31:16 32:8,14,15	110:20	74:8 90:6 108:8
58:19 59:25 60:3	32:24 109:24	37:11 47:11,13	talked 23:9,10	116:10 119:2
60:7,12 76:9,16	statute 12:16 13:3	48:3 49:4 52:22	24:11 26:19	122:5
76:17 77:8 78:17	13:7	53:5 64:9 75:8	140:25	telling 117:25
/0.1/ //.0 /0.1/	13.7	33.3 07.7 /3.0		Cining 117.23

tenant 32:6 61:21	122:3,18 123:24	73:24 74:13	turn 17:3 63:10	129:25
129:16 132:18,20	131:4,11 134:24	transferred 67:24	115:21	unprecedented
133:6	thinking 68:6	141:7	turned 115:5	112:19
tenant's 129:15	third-party 50:22	transfers 68:17	turning 16:25	unstable 8:19
133:13	thought 61:17	translates 31:14	two 6:24,25 7:12	unsure 14:18
tenants 18:7 33:21	82:24	transpired 10:11	10:15,16 12:2,3	unusual 112:18
34:2 66:9	three 7:8 11:5 58:4	trial 135:2	12:13 34:7 40:3	unusuai 112.16 update 137:17
terrible 128:25	94:23 95:10	trick 55:15	53:17,20,21 58:15	upside-down 94:16
test 18:9 65:16	114:18 121:4,9,10	Troichuk 7:18,25	82:22 89:7 95:19	upstairs 129:12
testified 4:17	tie-in 53:8	17:12 38:18 64:3	95:20 101:16	USAPROD-0000
139:24 140:15	tilt 64:15 65:23	127:14 129:8	125:17 126:22	104:11 146:14
testify 78:5 84:18	time 8:23 13:5,21	trouble 62:21 63:14	type 24:17 43:6	USAPROD-0003
84:20 85:16	17:9 18:8 21:25	true 147:13 148:13	types 90:13	67:13 144:19
109:10 122:22	40:6 49:2 50:24	trust 27:2,8 28:6	typically 16:8	USAPROD-0003
130:17	73:5 75:21 80:2	66:12,13 68:2,19	typically 10.6	104:11 146:15
testifying 102:5	82:23 113:21	69:18,18 71:7,15	U	USAPROD-0003
testing 102.3	115:13 116:18	72:10,11,12 74:3	U.S 3:4	94:2 145:21
testimony 4:12	124:23 136:13,22	74:14 75:23 80:2	ultimately 126:20	USAPROD-0003
147:13	137:2,24 142:13	80:16,21 81:5	unable 139:20	97:5 145:23
thank 17:7 19:12	times 126:17	91:4 92:10,15	unbelievable 8:20	USAPROD-0003
19:25,25 51:19	titled 69:11	99:25 100:17	uncovered 29:2	98:4 146:5
52:20 56:16 59:2	today 6:7,23 86:9	101:6,10 120:25	underlie 98:19	USAPROD-0003
61:16 78:25 87:4	122:10 138:22	121:3,6,6,7,14	125:4	67:13 144:19
103:13,17,18	told 68:7 88:3,8	141:23,23 142:4	underlying 7:3	USAPROD-0003
108:5,11 112:4	tool 21:9	144:23	9:23 51:2 89:4	69:6 144:21
116:5 123:12	top 84:25 85:12	trustee 68:21 74:19	114:21 123:7	USAPROD-0003
124:7 133:24	total 42:18,23	78:12 80:3,7	underneath 37:24	79:22 145:10
137:23,25 138:9	Tower 105:25	82:15,18,21 83:10	39:5	USAPROD-0003
138:18 139:8	106:2	83:14 91:6 92:7	understand 10:25	69:7 144:22
141:19 142:8	Township 24:7	92:10	11:3,14 30:15,18	USAPROD-0003
Thanks 142:10	25:2,23 26:22	trustees 80:15	41:22 72:4 77:23	99:13 146:7
thin 85:9	TP 117:13	141:20	85:12 114:20	USAPROD-0003
thing 53:5 58:25	tracer 19:13 20:4	trusts 6:24 82:22	123:4 126:7	99:14 146:7
63:25 65:19 71:2	20:18,21,24 21:8	118:24 120:22,24	138:16	USAPROD-0003
79:25 97:3 140:25	22:8 139:22	122:13 125:22	understanding	71:8 144:24
things 62:14 137:20	143:16	truthfulness	26:2 27:14,16	USAPROD-0003
think 5:16 18:20	tracers 22:10,12	111:15	35:4,6 54:15 57:9	71:9 144:24
22:18 23:25 24:3	23:2 139:17,19	try 31:11 48:16	92:9 114:23 115:3	USAPROD-0003
27:22 33:13 34:9	track 19:12 37:9	60:12 76:23,24	115:7 148:17	74:24 145:7
35:24 38:10 40:19	56:10	97:2 102:25	Understood 67:4	USAPROD-0003
43:12 45:13 46:5	traded 39:23 40:5	128:23 131:16,25	87:14 90:17 115:2	74:25 145:8
46:14,18 47:3,4	transactions 42:16	trying 27:22 45:24	Union 54:20,25	USAPROD-0003
71:3 88:13,18	transcript 13:10,11	46:2,6 51:12	55:5,11 144:8	79:21 145:10
94:14 95:22	102:22,22 104:10	56:20 65:20 82:20	unit 32:11 132:14	USAPROD-0004
105:20 107:14	121:19 142:12	90:20 91:20 123:3	United 1:2,3 52:11	81:12 145:12
109:15 111:24	146:14 148:10	123:11,15	139:14 148:5	USAPROD-0004
112:16 120:21	transfer 69:16 70:7	TURFRA 110:8	unobstructed	81:22 145:14
			<u> </u>	<u> </u>

USAPROD-0004	47:14 144:4	visited 124:15	116:18 121:2,3	X 143:2
89:13 145:19	USAPROD-0009	visited 124.13 voila 81:8	123:24 133:22	
USAPROD-0004	47:15 144:4	vs 116:17 117:8	140:22	Y
89:14 145:19	USAPROD-0009	148:6	we've 123:21,22	Y 4:14
USAPROD-0004	63:20 144:14	VSH 101:6	week 124:10	yeah 9:20 11:11,13
82:5 145:16	USAPROD-0009	VSHPHH 74:3,14	went 8:6 10:2,4	11:15,15 15:2
USAPROD-0004	63:21 144:14	91:4 101:10	36:25 61:8 66:8	18:15,17 22:9
82:6 145:17	USAPROD-0010	71.7 101.10	126:9,11 128:5,8	34:16,22 39:16
USAPROD-0004	100:7 146:9	$\overline{\mathbf{W}}$	120.3,11 128.3,8	43:8 61:13,20
73:8 145:5	USAPROD-0010	wait 29:14 125:2	130:2,3	62:6,6 66:25
USAPROD-0004	100:8 146:10	waiver 49:13	weren't 28:19	72:25 83:15,15
73:8 145:5	USAPROD-0010	walk 85:8	whereabouts	89:8 110:16 119:8
USAPROD-0004	100:22 146:12	want 4:23 10:24	131:19	120:15 126:11
16:20 143:14	USAPROD-0010	11:14 23:13 28:25	WHEREOF	129:22
		31:11 48:6 49:13	=	year 13:6 95:4,11
USAPROD-0005	100:23 146:12	49:14 51:9 58:24	147:20	96:15
16:21 143:15	usually 26:24	65:19 74:20 77:11	Whoa 65:17	years 12:7,8,9,11
USAPROD-0005	utilities 50:21 66:9	77:19,23 78:2,4	WIC 115:10,12	12:14 42:19 43:5
19:14 143:17	66:16 67:7	86:20 90:7 91:22	wife 74:14 106:5	50:14 95:14 96:5
USAPROD-0005	\mathbf{V}	93:16 98:23 99:2	William 111:6	96:8 135:14
23:19 143:19	v 1:7 4:14 63:5,9,15	102:6,25 107:5,17	withdraw 72:21	vield 66:10
USAPROD-0005	Vague 45:21	102.0,23 107.3,17	witness 4:7,9,13,15	York 2:10 4:3
23:20 143:19	Vague 43.21 Vahak 33:6 54:10	119:7 121:25	41:22 83:5 87:13	147:3,5,8
USAPROD-0005			92:25 103:20	
37:12 143:24	54:14 63:15 66:5	122:3 131:18	137:25 143:3	Yup 99:7
USAPROD-0005	73:25 74:14 88:10	133:19 142:11	147:11,14,20	$\overline{\mathbf{z}}$
37:13 143:24	117:19 121:5	wanted 4:24 14:21	witnessing 71:23	Zargis 17:17,24,25
USAPROD-0005	Valdez 114:17,19	17:10 65:18 112:8	woman 7:17 34:8	18:3,7,11,19,20
52:23 144:6	115:4	119:21	word 45:21	18:25 24:16 25:22
USAPROD-0006	various 23:18	wants 5:9	words 71:3 124:16	26:15 27:7,13,20
52:24 144:7	60:16 66:9 90:12	Washington 3:7	124:18	27:24
USAPROD-0006	111:13 116:13	wasn't 9:15,16 10:9	work 8:25 58:22	
65:2 144:16	143:18 144:11	45:3,6 107:12	122:20	ZNQ 1:6 zoom 2:7 99:10
USAPROD-0006	vehicle 6:14	137:8	worked 7:9	Z00III 2:7 99:10
65:3 144:17	veracity 111:16	water 47:24 48:4	working 136:25	0
USAPROD-0007	verify 74:21	50:21 51:25 65:11	works 134:18	07728 6:2
60:17 144:11	videoconferencing	way 5:25 7:21 17:9	world 43:13 107:19	08057 3:15
USAPROD-0007	2:8 4:6	30:23 39:22 44:23	worth 134:25	
60:18 144:12	view 114:5	61:8 99:6 114:18	wouldn't 93:9	1
USAPROD-0007	Village 32:2,7	142:3 147:18	127:5	1 5:14 16:22 68:2
31:17 143:21	55:19 56:25 60:24	ways 43:17,18 93:3	write 119:11	73:17 89:19 96:23
USAPROD-0008	61:5 64:19 74:11	we'll 5:4 79:19	writing 61:7,8,9	143:9,13
31:18 143:22	74:12 87:25 88:20	105:10,12 111:3	83:13	10 63:22 111:3
USAPROD-0008	125:19 129:3	142:11	written 37:19	113:24 138:5
54:21 144:9	140:14 141:15	we're 6:22 49:3	102:18 119:18	144:13
USAPROD-0008	Viro 34:9	58:9 60:22 66:25	wrong 43:6 61:8	10-minute 6:15
54:21 144:9	visible 29:6	67:6 73:2,6		100 146:8,11
USAPROD-0008	visit 83:22 84:3,11	103:13 105:11	X	100110.0,11
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

				1490 100
104 146:13	200 121:21	101:13 102:9	64 144:15	
1040 94:12,20	2001 137:10	105:15 143:18	668A 118:12,13	
1040 74:12,20 1041 74:23 75:23	2001 137.10 2002 94:12 95:11	30 54:18 113:25	67 144:18	
79:20,25 91:15	2002 94:12 93:11 2003 98:13	135:14	69 144:20	
145:7,9	2004 97:21	31 143:20		
1041s 74:21 82:13	2005 62:5	319,349.49 24:8	7	
82:17	2007 97:21	25:12	7 52:25 71:20 144:5	
1058 14:7	2011 69:24	32 50:14	700 62:24	
11 65:4 144:15	2012 69:23,25	35 65:7	71 144:23	
11/26/13 118:10	2013 74:23 75:22	3529 119:17	72 109:24	
1120 59:12	102:10,10 108:15	37 143:23	73 145:4	
12 67:14 81:9	145:7		74 145:6	
144:18	2014 79:20 94:17	4	79 145:9	
12/31/02 94:23	102:10 145:9	4 5:25 31:19 69:23		
12:03 1:16 2:3	2015 73:19	94:17 99:5 143:20	8	
12:52 113:25	2016 22:2 64:21	40 3:14 16:13	8 54:22 56:12 63:8	
1289 1:25	81:9	41,000 38:13	108:15 144:8	
13 69:8 144:20	2017 17:12 33:5,8	433 15:6 28:17	81 145:11,13	
138 143:6	49:3	47 105:12,14	82 145:15	
14 71:10 144:23	2018 102:11 113:25	115:19 144:3	89 145:18	
15 73:9 74:7 145:4	2019 137:13	5	9	
15th 147:21	2020 142:24		9 60:19 111:4	
16 22:4 75:2 143:13	2021 1:15 2:2	5 1:15 2:2 37:10,14	144:10	
145:6	147:22	99:5 108:14 143:5	90s 136:19	
17 16:15 62:19	20530 3:7	143:9,23	93 145:20	
79:23 145:9	21 89:15 145:18	52 144:5	950 3:6	
18 81:13 145:11	2105 73:17	520 21:15 53:13,17	97 145:22	
18-15099 1:6	22 17:11 94:3	54:6 65:14 68:8,9 83:24 86:22 87:23	98 146:4	
19 23:7 81:23	115:19 116:7	88:4 125:18	99 146:6	
143:16 145:13	145:20	126:11,12,23	77 1 10.0	
1991 135:18	23 97:6 143:18	132:8 139:10		
2	145:22	132.8 139.10		
	230 111:14	520B 53:18 54:7		
2 5:25 19:15 24:25	24 31:13,14 98:5	68:8		
26:19 61:23 64:12	146:4	54 144:8		
71:19,21 74:6	25 99:15 146:6	57 120:6		
84:24,25,25 85:12 89:24 90:4 91:17	26 99:7,10,18 100:9	58 118:22		
91:18 93:12 96:25	100:15 146:8			
98:16 101:13	27 99:7 100:24	6		
102:9 105:15,22	146:11	6 47:16 99:5 144:3		
143:16	28 99:8 100:20	60 144:10		
2.8 115:11	104:12 118:9 146:13	61 84:14		
2:58 142:13	140.13	6103 77:16,25		
20 23:25 24:2,25	3	84:15 85:10 87:8		
59:11 82:7 145:15	3 23:21 57:5 71:19	87:12		
148:23	71:21 98:16	63 144:13		